

行政院國家科學委員會專題研究計畫成果報告
驚異的重複／重複的驚異：前衛與語言、通俗文化、弱勢文化的
關係

The Repetition of Shock and the Shock of Repetition: The Avant-
garde and its Relationships with Language, Mass Culture, and
Minority Culture

計畫編號：NSC 91-2411-H-002-034

執行期限：91年8月1日至92年7月31日

主持人：廖咸浩 台灣大學外國語文學系

email: xliaoo@ccms.ntu.edu.tw

一、中文摘要

「前衛」是一個讓人目眩神迷，但也讓歷來學者為之費神苦思、論述不已的現象。但即使如此，前衛需要被討論的重要議題仍多，立論也大有空間。做為一個歷史現象，二十世紀初的「前衛運動」為時甚短，但卻為後世留下了取之不盡的資源。相當程度而言，歷史前衛的出現乃標示了現代主義的開始，但開路先鋒卻很快就被另一種較為溫和甚至保守的現代主義所取代。前衛為什麼會出現？它做了什麼？為什麼會被取代？為後世留下了什麼？這些問題批評家已經大量討論，但更值得論述的是：「前衛」這個詞曾被用在各種不同的文學及藝術（及文化）現象上，但其正當性也一再引起討論。也就是說，前衛能否被「重複」？假如可以，那麼它能否被如何的重複？重複到什麼程度？重複有無意義？重複與歷史脈絡的關係如何？

本計劃便將以「重複」為起點，來探討三個當前關於前衛的討論所未能深入或尚未觸及核心的議題：語言、通俗文化、弱勢文化

（1）論前衛與語言：文學前衛如何運用語言及其理論基礎為何，一直被簡約的描述成「挑戰」布爾喬亞的世界觀。但「布爾喬亞」的世界觀與語言運用之間的關係探討往往流於浮面，以致造成了兩種乍看幾乎是互相排斥的前衛語言策略論。更值得注意的是這兩種語言運用的方式又因為意識型態的瓜葛，而更形錯綜複雜。左翼與右翼的作者有可能用同樣的語言策略以達到完全相反的目的。因此，一般任意把所謂「前衛語言策略」認定為「激進」

的論述其實是不堪細究的。如此，則以這種非歷史的、本質化的方式界定「重複」，僅僅觸及了前衛的表象。換言之，必須要以「去中心」的方式來理解，才能獲至對前衛現象的脈絡化了解，也才能更公允的評估其長處與弱點。

（2）論前衛與通俗文化：前衛與通俗文化之間的關係也相當複雜。假如說前衛是對十九世紀文化遭「布爾喬亞化」的反動，那麼通俗文化似乎可以是前衛的盟友，因為歷史前衛自始都以再結合生活與藝術為職志。就此而言，通俗文化似乎已經做到。但從其他許多方面而言，兩者又南轅北轍。若將前衛理解為「反現代性」而不只是簡單的要把生活與藝術結合，那麼其與通俗文化的關係就比較曖昧。它雖仍可從通俗文化吸取靈感，但其目的卻不是要變成通俗文化，而是與之維持辯證的關係。

（3）論前衛與弱勢文化：自現代主義伊始，「原始」（或非西方的弱勢文化）就一直是一個主要的靈感來源。那麼前衛對原始或弱勢文化的挪用，到底開發了什麼？又遮蔽了什麼？這些問題不但在理論上有探討的空間，在政治上也有相當意涵。而且，如果這些較「原始」的社會也開始製作「前衛藝術」時，這種前衛藝術應如何理解？它是否也同樣的「挑戰」布爾喬亞價值？或只是在挑戰自身的文化傳統？若是後者，同樣的東西何以能既是前衛藝術的靈感，又是被前衛藝術挑戰的對象？這種前衛的兩難其實是弱勢文化（不管是國內的或國際的）共同的遭遇。對這些社會中的前衛藝術家而言，前衛藝術不可能是以自身受到西方布爾喬亞價值（這

(3) Since the very beginning of modernism, the primitive (or minority cultures) has been a major inspiration. Now what does the appropriation reveal and at the same time suppress about the primitive is an issue not only theoretically fascinating but also politically charged. And what if the primitive society also starts to create avant-garde art or write avant-garde poetry? Does it also challenge "the bourgeois values"? Or does it simply try to challenge its own tradition? If the latter were true, how could the same thing be at once that which is "avant-garde" and that which is "traditional," that which challenges and that which is challenged? This avant-garde quandary is in fact the common fate of minority culture (both domestically and internationally). For the avant-garde artist in these societies, the avant-garde cannot possibly be aimed at his own tradition because it is being endangered by Western bourgeois values (which sometimes also includes "the avant-garde" in the guise of just another fashionable Western cultural product). In order both to challenge Western bourgeois domination of the values of his contemporary society, he has to both draw inspiration from values of the native traditions (which are distinct from contemporary "native" values that have been profoundly "bourgeoisized") and contemporary Western avant-garde values (which are also distinct from and critical of the outmoded Western values that form the core of contemporary "native" values).

Keywords: avant-garde, language, mass culture, minority culture, repetition, modernism, bourgeois, modernity, native culture

二、緣由與目的

一般都認為「前衛」運動是現代主義的源頭。但現代主義後來的發展卻與前衛的初衷有相當的差異。前者對體制有強烈的反叛意圖，後者則不時顯現出與體制的妥協甚至共謀關係。從前衛到現代主義的

發展過程，在文學與美學上提供了豐富的思考與探索空間。比如，前衛為什麼會出現？它的企圖是什麼？實際上又做了什麼？為什麼會被取代？為後世留下了什麼？這些問題評論家對此已有大量的討論，但立論空間仍寬廣無限，視野也不斷推陳出新。其中前衛為後世留下了什麼這個論題，猶其在晚近受到聚焦的討論。也就是說，前衛到底是一種歷史現象？或是一種藝術或思考的模式？更簡單的講便是：前衛是否可以重覆？

前衛最初當然是一個歷史現象，其出現有一定的歷史條件，包括物質的客觀條件，以及前衛藝術家的主觀視野。將之視為歷史現象時，前衛雖然仍是個複雜的現象，但相對而言，較容易脈絡化 (contextualize) 處理。但若把前衛視為一種會重複出現的「模式」，則前衛的定義就開始模糊了起來，但前衛對後世的文化意義也由此而生。若是一種模式，那麼前衛便有了跨時空的意義，這時候，我們要問的就是，就前衛而言，時空是如何跨的？在不同的歷史時空下，前衛如何可能？

一般論者所關心的主要是當代西方的情境，比如後現代風的作品常被視為「新前衛」，但它們真的可能具有「前衛」的條件嗎？兩者間形式上的相似，會不會只是「形式」而非「實質」（即「反體制內涵」）的相似？Peter Burger 與 Calinescu 似都朝此方向思考。Burger 的 theory of the Avant-garde 更是明確的把前衛的企圖界定為反布爾喬亞的藝術獨立體制，把形式的實驗與歷史條件緊密結合，而在 Poggioli 的 theory of the avant-garde 的形式取向之外，另闢蹊徑。Burger 把前衛與歷史條件緊密結合的結論是，歷史前衛再結合生活與藝術的努力終歸失敗，而且前衛也不再可能。Andreas Huyssen 的看法類似，他指出後現代的新前衛把「前衛傳統」與「前衛實踐」二個矛盾的概念結合的企圖，本質上是反前衛的。但他並不認為前衛已然不可能，只是必須「歷史化」。

有時也包括某些以流行面貌輸入的前衛藝術)全面衝擊侵蝕,而已瀕臨絕種的傳統文化為對象。為了要「挑戰」西方的布爾喬亞價值的宰制,弱勢文化的藝術家必須同時從本土傳統(此與已遭相當程度布爾喬亞化的當代本土文化有所區隔)及當代西方前衛(此與西方舊布爾喬亞價值——也就是當代本土文化的核心——大不相同且對之批判)汲取靈感。因此其藝術的創作與評價,其實是相當的艱困而重大的任務。

關鍵詞：前衛、語言、通俗文化、弱勢文化、重複、現代主義、布爾喬亞、現代性、本土文化

Abstract

The phenomenon of the avant-garde is a fascinating as well as vexed one. And yet much remains to be explored. As a historical phenomenon, the avant-garde was short-lived but has left the posterity with seemingly limitless resources. To a great extent, the emergence of the historical avant-garde signified the beginning of modernism and yet it was a modernism soon compromised and eventually submerged by a more modest and often much less radical (and some would go so far as to say reactionary) form of modernism. Why did it arise in the first place, what did it do, why was it soon submerged and what legacy did it bequeath on us—these issues have engaged many critics. Even more interesting, however, is the fact that the epithet “avant-garde” has been applied to various literary and artistic (and even cultural) phenomena, but the legitimacy of doing so has remained in dispute. In other words, can the avant-garde be “repeated”? if so, in what way and to what extent can it repeated? Is there any point in repeating it? What is the relationship between repetition and historical context?

This project would like to adopt “repetition” as the starting point to explore three issues in the literary avant-gardes that

the current study of the avant-garde has so far touched upon either rather lightly or, I believe, in a far from sufficient manner: language, mass culture and minority culture.

(1) How does the literary avant-garde(s) utilize language and on what theoretical basis have usually been too faciledly construed as an attempt to challenge the bourgeois ways of perception. But the relationship between the “bourgeois” ways of perception and the language use remains unclear and that results in two distinct ways of contruing this challenge in terms of language strategies, which sometimes seem to contradict each other. And what’s more, the use (or rather ab-use) of language is often complicated by the ideological position of a writer; a rightwing writer and a leftwing writer could use exactly the same strategies for entirely different purposes. The all too easy assumption about “avant-garde language strategies” being “radical” runs aground as soon as we look closely. “Repetition” defined by the ahistorical, essentialized perception of the avant-garde, then, has only scratched the surface of the avant-garde phenomenon. In other words, a decentered approach to the avant-garde would enable a contextualized understanding of the strong and weak points of the “avant-garde.”

(2) The relationship between the avant-garde and mass culture is also a complex one. If the avant-garde arose in response to the bourgeoisization of culture, then mass culture seems to be a good ally of the avant-garde because the self-professed purpose of avant-garde agitation against bourgeois culture—sublation of art and life—seems to be in accord with mass culture’s goal. On most other accounts, however, they are diametrically opposite to each other. If, on the other hand, the avant-garde was construed instead as a reaction against the general trends of modernity, then it seems to hold a more ambiguous relationship with mass culture. It could certainly draw inspirations from mass culture. But its purpose is never to become mass culture but to maintain a subtle dialectic with mass culture.

但在普遍傾向將前衛現象予以歷史化（包括其可能與不可能）時，Hal Foster 卻在1999年 *The Return of the Real* 這本書中，又再度把前衛以「模式」對待。但Foster的論證卻非早期的單純的形式論，而是以心理分析「創傷」理論，重新解讀歷史前衛的出現，並由此來重新理解當代藝術的可能性。他的基本論點是：以創傷及對創傷之不斷回顧，來描述「歷史前衛」與「後繼前衛」關係。如此一來便打破了原先歷史主義論以起源為尊的局限，而為西方前衛藝術開啟了當代的可能性。

然而，在前衛研究大方向上的突破，並未能立即帶動前衛的其他議題跟進。如語言、大眾文化及弱勢文化等議題，都仍待開發或重審。就語言而言，包括如 Marjorie Perloff 有關前衛的著述等身、議題博雜，但論及語言及形式時，仍傾向於本質化，而未能更精緻的把語言（及形式）與時空脈絡結合，同時也未能把語言（及形式）與意識型態的關係複雜化。關於大眾文化與前衛的關係雖有相當討論（如 Huyssen 及 Foster 皆提供了相當重要的見解），但大眾文化的形勢日新月異，仍有偌大探討空間。大眾文化的意義，對西方社會與非西方社會（尤其是第三世界）的意義本就不一樣，尤其進入全球化情境之後，前衛的時空脈絡又為之一變，所謂大眾文化更需要更新的理解。如果，我們接受 Huyssen 的說法，視前衛與大眾文化的關係為一不斷的辯證，那麼這個辯證在西方社會與非西方社會是否有不同的進行方式，應該有更細膩的討論。至於前衛藝術的效果及評價，在加入非西方社會的視角之後，現有的西方評論典範也顯得相當不足。台灣及許多第三世界社會的文學及繪畫等領域屢有現代與本土之爭，主要原因之一便在於西方評論典範在應用上的膠柱鼓瑟。若能把前衛與弱勢文化的關係加以釐清，應能更清楚的看待前衛在西方社會與非西方社會的文化意義。

三、結果與討論

- 1) 本計畫執行過程中所遭遇的問題，皆能在原本的詮釋體系中迎刃而解。而且解決問題的過程又能更進一步對原先架構之詮釋體系有所增益，使本計畫之面貌更形完整。
- 2) 本計畫已完成論文一篇：2002/6/29-7/2. “(Where) Does Modernity Exist?: Two Receptions of Modernism in Taiwan.” Delivered at Crossroads in Cultural Studies, The 4th International Conference. (Tampere, Finland)

四、計劃成果自評

- 子) 本年度工作主要在整理關於前衛的種種論述中涉及語言（及形式）之議題者，並以前述各種理論重審之，再輔以歷史前衛詩、六七十年代美國前衛詩、美國當代及非西方（以台灣為主）前衛詩等四類實例為分析對象及佐證材料。目的在了解過去的各種被稱為前衛的文學現象，如何處理語言的問題。一方面，分析何以前衛處理語言的基本方式——扭曲語言（反對「自然語言」的使用）與語言演出（傾向「完全自然」）似有互相衝突的傾向？另一方面，拆解此二種語言策略被賦予的「激進」色彩，指出前衛的「驚異效果」應予「歷史化」。並印證前衛「重複」的可能性。
- 丑) 已發表論文一篇。初步探討前衛策略被馴化之現象。
- 寅) 本計劃時任之兼任研究生助理，皆能在研究方法上（蒐集資料、建檔、各種軟體之運用、當代理論之應用）有長足的進步，並對相關之前衛藝術與當代理論之議題有更進一步的了解。

五、參考文獻

- Agger, Ben. (1990) *The Decline of Discourse: Reading, Writing, and Resistance in Postmodern Capitalism*. New York: Falmer Press.

- Arac, Jonathan, ed. (1986) *Postmodernism and Politics*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.
- Attridge, Derek. (1988) *Peculiar Language: Literature as Difference from the Renaissance to James Joyce*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell UP.
- Bartlett, Lee. (1986) "What Is 'Language Poetry.'" *Critical Inquiry*. 12.4: 741-52.
- Bennett, Tony. (1979) *Formalism and Marxism*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Bernstein, Charles. (1983) *Resistance*. Windsor, Vt.: Awede.
- Bernstein, J. M. (1992) *The Fate of Art*. Cambridge, U.K.: Polity P.
- Borsch-Jacobsen, Mikkel. (1991) *Lacan: the Absolute Master*. Stanford: Stanford UP.
- Boyne, Roy and Rattansi, Ali, ed. (1990) *Postmodernism and Society*. London: MacMillan.
- Brandt, Joan. (1989) "The Theory and Practice of a 'Revolutionary' Text: Denis Roche's 'Le mecrit.'" *Yale French Studies*. 203-21.
- Burger, Peter. (1984) *Theory of the Avant-Garde*. Trans. Michael Shaw. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.
- Burgin, Victor. (1986) *The End of Art Theory*. London: Macmillan.
- Calinescu, Matei. (1987) *Five Faces of Modernity: Modernism, Avant-Garde, Decadence, Kitsch, Postmodernism*. Durham: Duke UP.
- Callinicos, Alex. (1989) *Against Postmodernism: A Marxist Critique*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Casey, Edward S. and Woody, Melvin J. (1983) "Hegel, Heidegger, Lacan: The Dialectic of Desire." *Interpreting Lacan*. New Haven and London: Yale UP.
- Connor, Steven. (1989) *Postmodernist Culture: An Introduction to Theories of the Contemporary*. Cambridge, Mass.: Basil Blackwell.
- Conte, Joseph M. (1991) *Unending Design: The Forms of Postmodern Poetry*. Ithaca and London: Cornell UP.
- Cook, Bradford, trans. and ed. (1956) *Mallarme: Selected Prose Poems, Essays and Letters*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press.
- Coward, Rosalind and Ellis, John. (1977) *Language and Materialism: Developments in Semiology and the Theory of the Subject*. London, Henley and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Creer, Michael. (1991) "Language Poetry in America 1971-1991." *Meanjin* 50: 149-56.
- Darragh, Tina. (1981) *on the corner to off the corner*. College Park, Md.: Sun & Moon Press.
- Davies, Judy. (1985) "Mechanical Millenium: Sant'Elia and the Poetry of Futurism." *Unreal City: Urban Experience in Modern European Literature and Art*. Ed. Edward Timms and David Kelley. Manchester: Manchester UP.
- Dean, Carolyn J. (1992) *The Self and Its Pleasures: Bataille, Lacan, and the History of the Decentered Subject*. Ithaca and London: Cornell UP.
- Derrida, Jacques. (1978) *Writing and Difference*. Chicago: The U of Chicago P.
- Dews, Peter. (1987) *Logics of Disintegration: Post-structuralist Thought and the Claims of Critical Theory*. London and New York: Verso.
- Eagleton, Terry. (1990) *The Ideology of the Aesthetic*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Easthope, Antony. (1983) *Poetry as Discourse*. London and New York: Methuen.
- Enzenberger, Hans Magnus. (1974) "The Aporias of the Avant-Garde." *Consciousness Industry: On Literature, Politics and the Media*. Ed. Michael

- Roloff. Trans. John Simon. New York: The Seabury P.
- Elliott, Anthony. (1992) *Social Theory and Psychoanalysis in Transition*. Oxford UK and Cambridge USA: Blackwell.
- Ferry, Luc. (1993) *Homo Aesthetics: The Invention of Taste in the Democratic Age*. Trans. Robert de Laiza. Chicago and London: The U of Chicago P.
- Fiedler, Leslie. (1971) *The Collected Essays of Leslie Fiedler*. New York: Stein and Day.
- Foster, Hal. (1983) "Postmodernism: A Preface." *The Anti-Aesthetic: Essays on Postmodern Culture*. Ed. Hal Foster. Port Townsend, Wash.: Bay Press.
- . (1999) *The Return of the Real*.
- Foucault, Michel. (1981) *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews*. Trans. Donald Bouchard and Sherry Simon. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell UP.
- Frazer, Nancy and Nicholson, Linda. (1988) "Social Criticism without Philosophy: An Encounter between Feminism and Postmodernism." *Universal Abandon: The Politics of Postmodernism*. Ed. Andrew Ross. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.
- Gaggi, Silvio. (1989) *Modern/Postmodern: A Study in Twentieth-century Arts and Ideas*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P.
- Gallop, Jane. (1981) *Intersections: A Reading of Sade with Bataille, Blanchot, and Klossowski*. Lincoln and London: U of Nebraska P.
- Gilbert, Roger. (1992) "Textured Information: Politics, Pleasure, and Poetry in the Eighties." *Contemporary Literature*. 33.2: 243-76.
- Gitlin, Todd. (1989) "Postmodernism: Roots and Politics." *Dissent*. (winter): 100-108 [Abridged and summarized in *Ute Reader*, July/ Aug 1990]
- Graff, Gerald. (1979) *Literature against Itself: Literary Ideas in Modern Society*. Chicago & London: The U of Chicago P.
- . (1982) "Textual Leftism." *Partisan Review*. 49.4: 559-75.
- Graybeal, Jean. (1993) "Kristeva's Delphic Proposal: Practices Encompasses the Ethical." *Ethics, Politics, and Difference in Julia Kristeva's Writing*. Ed. Oliver, Kelly. New York and London: Routledge.
- Griffin, David. (1988) *The Reenchantment of Science: Postmodern Proposals*. Albany: State U of New York P.
- Guerlac, Suzanne. (1993) "Transgression in Theory: Genius and the Subject of *La Revolution du langage poetique*." *Ethics, Politics, and Difference in Julia Kristeva's Writing*. Ed. Kelly Oliver. New York and London: Routledge.
- Habermas. (1987) "Between Eroticism and General Economics: Georges Bataille." *The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity: Twelve Lectures*. Trans. Frederick G. Lawrence. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT P.
- . (1983) "Modernity—An Incomplete Project." *Anti-Aesthetic*. Ed. Hal Foster. Port Townsend, Wash.: Bay P.
- Harari, Josue V, ed. (1979) *Textual Strategies: Perspectives in Post-Structuralist Criticism*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell UP.
- Hartley, George. (1989) *Textual Politics and the Language Poets*. Bloomington: Indiana UP.
- Hermand, Jost, and Martin, Biddy. (1983) "The Commercialization of Avant-Garde Movements at the Turn of the Century." *New German Critique*. 29: 71-83)
- Hill, Leslie. (1990) "Julia Kristeva: Theorizing the Avant-Garde?" *Abjection, Melancholia, and Love*.

- Ed. John Fletcher and Andrew Benjamin. 137-56.
- Hirschkop, Ken. (1990) "Short Cuts through the Long Revolution: The Russian Avant-Garde and the Modernization of Language." *Textual Practice* 4.3: 428-41.
- Hoesterey, Ingoborg, ed. (1991) *Zeitgeist in Babel: The Postmodernist Controversy*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP.
- Hollier, Denis. (1977) *Against Architecture*.
- Howe, Irving. (1967) "The Idea of the Modern." *Literary Modernism*. Ed. Irving Howe. Greenwich, Conn.: Fawcett Publications.
- Hutcheon, Linda. (1988) *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction*. New York and London: Routledge.
- . (1986) *A Theory of Parody*. New York and London: Methuen.
- Huyssen, Andreas. (1986) *After the Great Divide: Modernism, Mass Culture, Postmodernism*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP.
- Isaak, Jo Anna. (1986) *The Ruin of Representation in Modernist Art and Texts*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: U. M. I. Research P.
- Jameson, Fredric. (1991) *Postmodernism, or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism*. Durham: Duke UP.
- Jardine, Alice. (1993) "Opaque Texts and Transparent Contexts: The Political Difference of Julia Kristeva." *Ethics, Politics, and Difference in Julia Kristeva's Writing*. Ed. Oliver, Kelly. New York and London: Routledge.
- Kalaidjian, Walter. (1991) "Transpersonal Poetics: Language Writing and the Historical Avant-Gardes in Postmodern Culture." *American Literary History* 3.2: 319-36.
- Katz, Barry. (1982) *Herbert Marcuse and the Art of Liberation*. London: Verso.
- Kavanagh, James. (1982) "Marxism's Althusser: Toward a Politics of Literary Theory." *Diacritics*. 12: 25-45.
- Kellner, Douglas. (1989) *Jean Baudrillard: From marxism to Postmodernism and Beyond*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Kellner, Douglas, ed. (1989) *Postmodernism/Jameson/Critique*. Washington, D. C.: Maisonneuve Press.
- Kristeva, Julia. (1984) *Revolution in Poetic Language*. New York: Columbia UP.
- Krysinsky, Wladimir. (1985) "manifesto, Avant-gardes, and Transgressive Modernity." *Aims and Prospects of Semiotics: Essays in Honor of Algirdas Julien Greimas*. Vol. I. Ed. Herman Parret and Hans-George Ruprecht. John Benjamins Publishing Company. 41-52.
- Lacan, Jacques. (1977) *Ecrits: A Selection*. Trans. Alan Sheridan. New York and London: W. W. Norton and Company.
- Land, Nick. (1992) *The Thirst for Annihilation: Georges Bataille and Virulent Nihilism*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Lawson, Andrew. (1990) "Farewell to the Avant-Gardes: Some Notes towards the Definition of a Counterculture." *Textual Practice*. 4.3: 442-49.
- Lazer, Hank. (1990) "The Politics of Form and Poetry's Other Subjects: Reading Contemporary American Poetry." *American Literary History*. 2.3: 503-27.
- Lechte, John. (1990) *Julia Kristeva*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Lee, Jonathan Scott. (1990) *Jacques Lacan*. Boston: Twayne Publishers.
- Lentricchia, Frank. (1980) *After the New Criticism*. Chicago: The U of Chicago P.
- Liao, Hsien-hao. (1992) "The Avant-gardist Anxiety: The Struggle for Canonical Space between Poetry and

- Fiction." *Chung-wai Literary Monthly*. 21.2: 169-81
- . (1993) "The Rebellion of Materialism: Reading Xia Yu's 'Feminine Poetry in light of Literary History, feminization, and Postmodernism.'" *Women and Contemporary Taiwanese Literature*. Ed. Zheng Mingli. Taipei: China Times Publishing Company. 237-72.
- Lippard, Lucy R. (1970) rpt. 1988) *Pop Art*. London: Thames and Hudson.
- Lucie-Smith, Edward. (1981) rpt. 1988) *Concepts of Modern Art*. Ed. Nikos Stangos. London: Thames and Hudson, Ltd.
- MacCannell, Juliet Flower. (1986) *Figuring Lacan: Criticism and the Cultural Unconscious*. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P.
- Marx-Scouras, Danielle. (1991) "Requiem for the Postwar Years: The Rise of *Tel Quel*." *The French Review*. 64.3: 407-16.
- McGann, Jerome. (1987) "Contemporary Poetry, Alternate Route." *Politics and Poetic Value*. Ed. Robert von Hallberg. Chicago: The U of Chicago P. 253-76.
- Megill, Allan. (1985) *Prophets of Extremity: Nietzsche, Heidegger, Foucault, Derrida*. Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: U of California P.
- Mellencamp, Patricia. (1990) *Indiscretions: Avant-Garde Film, Video, and Feminism*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana UP.
- Middleton, Peter. (1990) "Language Poetry and Linguistic Activism." *Social Text*. 21/22: 242-53.
- Montag, Warren. (1988) "What Is at Stake in the Debate on Postmodernism?" in *Postmodernism and Its Discontents: Theories and Practice*. Ed. E. Ann Kaplan. London and New York: Verso.
- Norris, Christopher. (1990) *What's Wrong with Postmodernism: Critical Theory and the Ends of Philosophy*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP.
- Oliver, Kelly. (1993) "Introduction: Julia Kristeva's Outlaw Ethics." *Ethics, Politics, and Difference in Julia Kristeva's Writing*. Ed. Oliver, Kelly. New York and London: Routledge.
- Ong, Walter J. (1982) *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word*. London and New York: Methuen.
- Paz, Octavio. (1975) *Children of the Mire: Modern Poetry from Romanticism to the Avant-Garde*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP.
- Pefanis, Julian. (1991) *Heterology and the Postmodern: Bataille, Baudrillard, and Lyotard*. Durham and London: Duke UP.
- Ross, Andrew. (1991) "Hacking Away at the Counterculture." *Technoculture*. Ed. Constance Penley and Andrew Ross. Minneapolis and Oxford: U of Minnesota Press.
- Perloff, Majorie. (1981) *The Poetics of Indeterminacy: Rimbaud to Cage*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton UP.
- . (1985) *The dance of the intellect: Studies in the poetry of the Pound tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.
- . (1986) *The Futurist Moment: Avant-Garde, Avant Guerre, and the Language of Rupture*. Chicago and London: The U of Chicago P.
- . (1987) "New Nouns for Old: 'Language' Poetry, Language Game, and the Pleasure of the Text." *Exploring Postmodernism*. Eds. Matei Calinescu & Douwe Fokkema. Amsterdam: Benjamins.
- . (1990) *Poetic Licence: Essays on Modernist and Postmodernist Lyric*. Evanston, Illinois: Northwestern UP.
- . (1991) *Radical Artifice: Writing Poetry in the Age of Media*. Chicago: U of Chicago P.

- Perloff, Majorie, ed. (1988) *Postmodern Genre*. Norman and London: U of Oklahoma P
- Poggioli, Renato. (1968) *The Theory of the Avant-Garde*. Trans. Gerald Fitzgerald. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap P of Harvard U P.
- Radhakrishnan, R. (1989) "Poststructuralist Politics: Towards a Theory of Coalition." *Postmodernism/ Jameson/ Critique*. Ed. Douglas Kellner. Washington, D. C.: Mauseonneuve Press.
- Ragland-Sullivan, Ellie. (1986) *Jacques Lacan: and the philosophy of psychoanalysis*. Urbana and Chicago: U of Illinois P.
- Rajan, Tilottama. (1993) "Trans-Positions of Difference: Kristeva and Post-Structuralism" *Ethics, Politics, and Difference in Julia Kristeva's Writing*. Ed. Kelly Oliver. New York and London: Routledge.
- Richman, Michele H. (1982) *Reading George Bataille*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins UP.
- Richter, Hans. (1965) *Dada: Art and Anti-Art*. New York: Harry N. Abrams.
- Rose, Margaret A. (1991) *The Post-modern and the Post-industrial*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP.
- Rosenau, Pauline Marie. (1992). *Post-Modernism and the Social Sciences: Insights, Inroads, and Intrusions*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton UP.
- Ross, Andrew, ed. (1988) *Universal Abandon: The Politics of Postmodernism*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.
- Russell, Charles. (1985) *Poets, Prophets, & Revolutionaries: The Literary Avant-garde from Rimbaud through Postmodernism*. New York & Oxford: Oxford UP.
- Sayre, Henry M. (1989) *The Object of performance: The American Avant-Garde since 1970*. Chicago and London. The U of Chicago P.
- Schulte-Sasse, Jochen. (1984) "Forward: Theory of Modernism versus Theory of the Avant-Garde." *Theory of the Avant-Garde*. Peter Burger. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.
- Shaviro, Steven. (1990) *Passion and Excess: Blanchot, Bataille, and Literary Theory*. Tallahassee: The Florida State UP.
- Silliman, Ron. (1983) *ABC*. Berkeley: Tuumba
- (1984) "Disappearance of the Word, Appearance of the World." *The L=A=N=G=U=A=G=E Book*. Eds. Bruce Andrews and Charles Bernstein. Carbondale & Edwardsville: Southern Illinois UP.
- (1986) *In the American Tree: Language, Realism, Poetry*. Orono, Maine: National Poetry Foundation. xv.
- Silver, Kenneth E. (1989) *Esprit de Corps: The Art of the Parisian Avant-Garde and the First World War, 1914-1925*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton UP.
- Silverman, Kaja. (1983) *The Subject of Semiotics*. New York and Oxford: Oxford UP.
- Stanton, Domna C. (1988) "Language and Revolution: The Franco-American Dis-connection." *The Future of Difference*. ed. Alice Jardine.
- Suleiman, Susan Rubin. (1989) "As Is." *A New History of French Literature*. Ed. Denis Hollier. Cambridge: Harvard UP. 1011-18.
- (1990) *Subversive Intent: Gender, Politics and the Avant-garde*. Cambridge: Harvard UP.
- Symons, Arthur. (1971) *The Symbolist Movement in Literature*. New York: Haskell House Publishers, Ltd.
- Williams, Anne. (1984) *Prophetic Strain: The Greater Lyric in the Eighteenth Century*. Chicago & London: The U of Chicago P.
- Valaoritis, Nanon. (1981) Introduction to "Poesie, Language USA." *Change* 41 (Paris). 159.

- Yaeger, Patricia. S. (1986)
"Emancipatory Discourse"
Contemporary Literature. 27.2: 246-56.
- Zizek, Slavoj. 1989. *The Sublime Object of Ideology*. London & New York: Verso..
- , 1991. *Looking Awry: An Introduction to Jacques Lacan through Popular Culture..* Cambridge, Mass & London, UK: MIT Press.
- , 1992. *Enjoy Your Symptom*. New York & London: Routledge.
- , 1997. *The Plague of Fantasies*. London & New York: Verso.