

行政院國家科學委員會專題研究計畫 成果報告

創傷與奮起：九 年代以來的台灣女性小說(3/3)

計畫類別：整合型計畫

計畫編號：NSC93-2411-H-002-007-BG

執行期間：93年08月01日至94年07月31日

執行單位：國立臺灣大學外國語文學系暨研究所

計畫主持人：劉亮雅

報告類型：完整報告

處理方式：本計畫可公開查詢

中 華 民 國 94年5月13日

2004 年行政院國科會專題研究計劃期中成果報告

計畫名稱：邊緣再思：文化、創痛、再現——創傷與奮起：九〇年代以來的台灣女性小說 (3/3)

主持人：國立台灣大學外文系教授 劉亮雅

研究生助理：廖勇超、周盈秀

計劃類別：整合型計劃

計劃編號：編號 NSC 93-2411-H-002-007-BG

執行期間：93 年 8 月 1 日至 94 年 7 月 31 日

執行單位：台灣大學外文系暨研究所

中華民國 94 年 5 月 12 日

(一) 中文摘要

台灣女性小說自九〇年代便展現出不同的形貌，像李昂、平路、朱天心、朱天文的國族寓言，李昂、邱妙津、洪凌、成英妹、陳雪的身體書寫，朱天文、朱天心、施叔青對陰性文化的探索，均超出於前期。這一方面乃因前期的女性文學已累積許多成果，另一方面則是因政治解嚴和女性主義運動、同志運動蓬勃發展，使得許多禁忌除魅了，而居於弱勢的女性之議題也得以被更細緻地探討。本計劃三年為期，將援用女性主義理論、女同志理論、文化理論分別研究九〇年代以來台灣女性小說所出現的三個主題：(1)女同性戀創傷；(2)女性創傷與女性情誼；(3)女性與通俗文化，並將之放置於兩個脈絡：一是戰後以來台灣女性文化，另一則是戰後以來有關女性創傷經驗的小說。從這兩個不同脈絡中，更可比較九〇年代以來台灣女性小說與前期小說的異同，並突顯這三個主題代表了台灣女性文化的兩個新貌：(一)對女性創傷經驗的再思，(二)女性從邊緣出發提出另類想像或視角。

第一年計劃將處理九〇年代以來台灣女性小說中觸及女同性戀創傷的文本。在這方面邱妙津的《鱷魚手記》及《蒙馬特遺書》當然是經典，由於我以前已專文處理過，因此將改而處理凌煙的《失聲畫眉》、曹麗娟的〈童女之舞〉、〈關於他的白髮及其他〉、陳雪〈夢遊 1994〉、〈蝴蝶的記號〉和〈夜的迷宮〉、張亦絢〈家族之始〉、〈幸福鬼屋〉、〈性愛故事〉和〈迷幻桌布〉、杜修蘭的《逆女》等等。這些創傷涉及了女同性戀受到的來自家庭與社會的歧視和打壓、失去母親、愛慾關係本身的問題等等，同時，這些創傷也有階級、族裔等差異。然則如何得到救贖或者某種形式的療癒？或者只要異性戀主義和恐同性戀心態存在，便不可能療癒或救贖，各篇提供的答案並不相同。此外，每篇的書寫策略也值得探究。

第二年計劃將處理九〇年代以來的台灣女性小說中的女性創傷與女性情誼。由於不擬和第一年計劃重疊，此處的女性創傷只包括女同性戀以外的失戀、

喪母、墮胎以及被強暴女性、情婦、棄婦的創傷經驗。這類主題前期作品未必沒有，但多半處理創傷發生的當下經驗，例如李昂 1983 年發表的小說《殺夫》處理婚姻內的強暴。同樣的，前期作品也較少著墨於女性情誼作為女性的感情支援系統之重要性。九〇年代以來則常處理事後創傷記憶的縈繞糾纏，或是早已遺忘卻因某事突然啟動創傷記憶，書寫策略的差異顯現對創傷經驗更細膩地反思。有些創傷像揭開的瘡疤無法收口，有些創傷則因(想像)女性情誼而得到救贖或平撫。處理的文本將包括：平路〈微雨魂魄〉、〈暗香餘事〉、〈凝脂溫泉〉、蘇偉貞〈五月榴花〉、張亦絢〈淫人妻女〉、陳雪《惡魔的女兒》、章緣〈女兒心〉、〈天生綠拇指〉、〈害怕一扇窗〉、張惠菁的《末日早晨》等等。

第三年計劃將處理九〇年代以來的台灣女性小說中的女性與通俗文化。文本將包括朱天文〈尼羅河女兒〉、〈帶我去吧！月光〉、〈紅玫瑰呼叫你〉、〈柴師父〉、〈世紀末的華麗〉、《荒人手記》、李昂《迷園》、平路〈婚期〉、施叔青《微醺彩妝》等等。通俗文化包含很廣，從羅曼史小說、漫畫、流行歌、到廣告、時尚、電影等等。Huysen 認為，通俗文化常被視為陰性，與女人打上等號，因為在西方的脈絡裡，掌有文化傳統的男作家貶斥女作家所寫的乃是通俗文學。台灣通俗文化一向蓬勃，在九〇年代更成了主導文化。九〇年代以來台灣女性小說處理女性與通俗文化的關係，可說有此背景在。小說中處理此一主題，涉及的議題包括：女性是否對通俗文化自我投射，虛擬其與真實的關係？通俗文化是讓女性形塑自戀鏡像，取得自信和力量？抑或讓女性陷溺，加大幻想與現實的鴻溝，遂更加感到自卑和創痛？抑或通俗文化的內涵複雜，其對女人的影響亦是多重的？

關鍵詞：女同性戀創傷、女性創傷、女性情誼、通俗文化、記憶、九〇年代以來台灣小說、女性小說、性別政治、書寫策略、女性主義文學與文化研究、女同志文學與文化研究

(二) 英文摘要

In the light of feminist and lesbian theories and cultural theories, this three-year project seeks to explore respectively three themes in Taiwan women's fiction since 1990: (1) lesbians' trauma; (2) women's trauma and female bonding; (3) women and popular culture. I shall put these three themes into two contexts: that of Taiwan women's culture since 1945, and that of Taiwan women's fiction about women's trauma since 1945. In so doing, I shall be able to compare the differences and similarities between Taiwan women's fiction since 1990 and that prior to 1990. Moreover, this will enable me to underline how the three themes represent two new aspects of Taiwan women's culture: (A) a rethinking on women's traumatic experience; (B) women's alternative imagination or perspective

from the margin of the dominant culture.

The first year will dwell on the theme of lesbians' trauma in Taiwan women's fiction since 1990. The texts I shall deal with include Yen Ling's *Birds that Have Lost Their Voices*, Li-chuan Tsao's "The Girl-Child's Dance" and "About Her Gray Hair and Other Stuff," Shueh Chen's "Dream Walking in 1994," "The Mark of a Butterfly," and "The Labyrinth of the Night," Yi-shuan Chang's "The Beginning of the Family," "A Happy Ghost House," "An Erotic Story," and "A Phantasmagoric Tablecloth," and Shiu-lan Tu's *Bad Girls*. These traumas have to do with discrimination and oppression from family and the society, loss of mother, or the problems with love relationships. These traumas may contain differences in class and ethnicity. But how to obtain redemption or some forms of healing? Can it be that no redemption is possible so long as there is heterosexism and homophobia? The answers offered by the texts are different. The writing strategy of each piece is also worth studying.

The second year will dwell on women's trauma and female bonding in Taiwan women's fiction since 1990. In order not to overlap with the first-year project, here the women's traumas exclude those of lesbians; these traumas stem from loss of love, loss of mother, having an abortion, being raped or abandoned, etc. Such subject matter appears in previous Taiwan women's fictional texts, but often treated solely as an immediate experience (take for an example the portrayal of the matrimonial rape in Ang Li's *Butcher's Wife* in 1983). Likewise, previous Taiwan women's fictional texts seldom depict female bonding as an important emotional support system for women. Taiwan women's fiction since 1990 often deals with traumas as after-shocks or haunting memories. The change in writing strategies reveals a re-consideration about traumatic experiences. Some traumas are like opened scars, while some are healed by (imagining) female bonding. The texts that I shall deal with include Lu Ping's "The Ghost on the Rainy Evening," "The Evocative Smell," and "The Spring," Wei-cheng Su's "Mayflower," Yi-shuan Chang's "Wife and Daughter of a Womanizer," Shueh Chen's *The Devil's Daughter*, Yuan Chang's "The Daughter's Heart," "A Born Green Finger," and "Fear of a Window," and Huei-ching Chang's *The Apocalyptic Morning*.

The third year will dwell on the theme of women and popular culture in Taiwan women's fiction since 1990. The texts I shall deal with include Tien-wen Chu's "Daughter of the Nile," "Take Me Away, Moonlight!" "Red Rose Calling You," "Master Chai," "Fin-de-Siecle Splendor," and *Notes from a*

Desolate Man, Ang Li's *The Labyrinthine Garden*, Lu Ping's "The Engagement," and Shu-ching Shi's *The Make-Up*. Popular culture ranges from romance fiction, cartoon, pop songs, advertisement, fashion, to movies. Andreas Huyssen argues that popular culture is often seen as feminine and equated with women, since in the West male writers as cultural inheritors dismiss female writers' works as popular trash. Popular culture has been influential in Taiwan, and has become dominant culture in the 1990s. This may stir up interest in the relationship between women and popular culture in serious women's writing. The issues are: do women project themselves onto popular culture, in order to have imaginary relationship with the real? Does popular culture enable women to form narcissistic mirror-image so as to gain self-confidence and strength? Or does popular culture contribute to women's self-indulgence, widen the gap between fantasy and reality, and so make women feel more inferior and pain? Or does popular culture have complicated content, so that its influence on women is diverse and complex?

Key words: trauma, female bonding, popular culture, memory, Taiwan fiction since 1990, women's fiction, gender politics, writing strategies, feminist literary and cultural studies, lesbian literary and cultural studies

(三) 赴美參加學術會議心得與成果：

94年1月19日，與國科會「邊緣再思」整合型計劃的其他五位成員：簡瑛瑛、廖朝陽、廖炳惠、邱貴芬、單德興共赴洛杉磯UCLA參加大型學術會議。該會議由該校東亞與言語文化系史書美、John Duncan和Michael Bourdaghs三位教授籌辦。主辦單位是該校比較與跨學科研究中心，協辦單位則為加州大學跨國與跨殖民研究群，國科會也是贊助單位。本次會議以「普世思想的翻譯：理論走過亞洲」(Translating Universals: Theory Moves Across Asia)為主題，主要探討理論在亞洲不同地方翻譯、挪用、生產和再生產的情況。會議從1月21日到1月22日，為期兩天，論文發表者來自日、韓、美國、越南及台灣，包括研究台灣、中國、日本、韓國、越南等不同區域的學者，其中Naoki Sakai、Stefan Tanaka、史書美、廖炳惠、廖朝陽都屬國際知名學者。有一場即以「今天的台灣和理論翻譯」為主題，可說是讓台灣研究及台灣學者增加國際能見度的一次努力。五個場次主題分別為「Asian Universals」、「Universals in the Age of Empire」、「Universals, Decolonization, and the Cold War」、「Post-1968 Universals in Translation」、「Taiwan and the Translations of Theory Today」，最後則有一場東亞學者的圓桌會議「Translating Theory Today—

Roundtable with participants from East Asia」。論文題目涉及西方與東方現代性、文化翻譯過程中的可譯性與不可譯性等等。

籌辦人 Michael Bourdaghs 在開場白中指出「普世思想」與「翻譯」都須打上引號，因它們並非不證自明，而尤其須批判西方霸權。會議除了打破西方中心、歐洲中心之外，拋出了許多問題。例如，除了現代性和理論等等來自西方以外，在前現代較不受西方影響時期，亞洲本身有哪些普世性的思想？例如儒家思想。它在亞洲其他區域的翻譯產生什麼影響、變化或抗拒？東方與西方真的是二元對立嗎？還是有多元的西方與多元的東方？例如，對於亞洲許多國家而言，明治維新後的日本比起許多地理位置上的西方國家其實更為西方。但「多元的西方」與「多元的東方」是否又陷入特殊化的窘境？另一方面，普世性與特殊性也並非真的二元對立。因普世性總與翻譯有關；唯有當一件事物可被翻譯它才具普世性。於是普世性總是要離開它的發源地，普世性要與斷裂的差異協商。

本人論文〈酷兒理論與政略在台灣〉從台灣同志/酷兒運動、翻譯酷兒理論、命名、酷兒運動者與媒體及通俗文化合作的關係、酷兒文學、酷兒運動者與後現代及後殖民的關聯等面向探討台灣對酷兒理論的翻譯、生產與再生產。頗受評論人和台下觀眾讚賞，史書美教授認為我寫得很完整，幾乎可以立刻出版。尤其當我談到台灣以「同志」翻譯 gay and lesbian，有時「同志」也代表 queer 時，更引起許多討論。一位韓國籍學者便想研究在前共產主義國家（尤其已唾棄共產主義的國家）會如何看待這項翻譯。一位研究文革的義大利籍學者很好奇中國對於這項翻譯會如何接收。一位印度籍女學者則想知道是否有人寫台灣的同性戀歷史或台灣的情色史。還有一位韓國籍學者則私下向我表示，台灣應該結合韓國、日本、越南等學者一起打破中國中心。

其他人的論文像廖朝陽的“Translatability and ‘Real’ Translation”、邱貴芬的“Border Historiography and the Politics of Translation in the Age of Cultural Flows”、單德興的“Representing Edward Said in Taiwan”也引起許多討論。參加這次盛大的學術研討會，令我深深覺得台灣學者組團參加國際會議、集體出擊的重要性。當台灣面臨外交困境，要打破在國際社會中被邊緣化的不利位置，透過展現台灣研究的成果是一個很好的國際文化交流方式。尤其如果我們結合亞洲和美國學術圈，在亞洲區域研究裡形成打破中國文化霸權的新力量，對於突顯台灣將非常有利。國科會等單位宜多多贊助國內學者集體參加此類會議，因其花費少於其他許多活動，而影響力卻是深遠的。

(四)研究成果討論：

本年度計劃探討女性創傷與通俗文化。成果包括兩篇學術論文及我替《中外文學》33卷7期(2004年12月)主編的專輯「跨國文化與台灣文學」。兩篇論文第一篇探討是施叔青小說《微醺彩妝》，題目是〈後現代，還是後殖民？：《微醺彩妝》中的景觀、歷史書寫以及跨國與本土的辯證〉，已發表在《中外文學》33卷7期(2004年12月)：77-101。第二篇則是英文論文“Queer Theory and Politics in Taiwan”〈酷兒理論與政略在台灣〉，發表在2005年1月22日UCLA所辦的Translating Universals: Theory Moves Across Asia國際學術研討會，上一部分已談過。以下是兩篇文章的節錄：

I. 〈後現代，還是後殖民？：《微醺彩妝》中的景觀、歷史書寫以及跨國與本土的辯證〉

施叔青的《微醺彩妝》容易讓人想起朱天文的〈世紀末的華麗〉及《荒人手記》，同樣都勾勒出浮華、追逐流行、資訊爆炸的後現代台灣，形式上也似乎都藉拼貼各種報導、知識建構小說世界。然而較諸〈世紀末的華麗〉及《荒人手記》以性別跨界、雅痞族、同性戀、眷村、台北為其關懷焦點，《微醺彩妝》卻以紅酒熱牽引出不同族群背景職業的男女，從醫生、媒體人、商人、前外交官、到家庭主婦，他們的行跡跨越台灣南北、城鄉，甚至跨國。如果說《微醺彩妝》刻意與〈世紀末的華麗〉及《荒人手記》形成互文(intertextual)關係，它的跨出台北、跨出單一族群的視角，無疑更具企圖心。《微醺彩妝》描寫紅酒熱藉由媒體、名流、時髦人士、酒商炒出來，形成跨階級的通俗文化。而其背景乃是經濟繁榮，對生活品質講究，高唱朝國際化、精緻化發展的九〇年代末期。書中除了紅酒熱，還呈現其他如時尚、香水等通俗文化，透過媒體人作為中介和推廣角色，顯現全球化浪潮下跨國資本主義商品邏輯：商品經由廣告產生附加價值，使人們趨之若鶩，購買以獲得身分地位象徵。流動的新的身分也隨之打造出來；後現代的「以假亂真」、真假不分、文化雜燴一一出現。然則這些以及許多透過媒體商品化而產生的後現代景觀亦只是小說的一部分。

《微醺彩妝》刻畫一個通俗文化活絡的台灣社會，從漫畫、王菲專輯、到棒球、時尚、紅酒熱，它似乎著眼於描繪人物與通俗文化的關係，藉以勾勒九〇年代台灣的某種精神面貌。廖炳惠犀利地指出，施叔青長年旅居美國、香港，《微醺彩妝》可以代表她作為一個跨國旅行者的本土轉折，而這個轉折透露出她對台灣既排斥又認同的複雜心理(376)，但廖炳惠比較著墨於《微醺彩妝》如何以病理學角度諷刺台灣社會炒作流行「所呈現的淺薄、空洞、病態面向」(377)，我則也想探究書中對台灣怪現象「錯綜的認同」(廖炳惠381)。這種認同可能針對王德威所說的「台灣粗糙卻生猛的種種現象」(34)，也可能針對後現代與後殖民角力下的台灣。當跨國資本及外來文化在台灣都具有一定的影響力之時，所謂的「本土」認同與跨國形成某種緊張關係：跨國是否只是伸張歐美日文化帝國主義？本土是否淪為狹隘封閉的民族主義？而當本土混雜跨國文化影響，跨國含有本土歷

史背景，則顯現跨國與本土乃是正反合的二元辯證。於是《微醺彩妝》表面上描繪在後現代台灣，商品、影像和資本皆在全球化流動之中，但其底蘊卻是具有後殖民視野的歷史書寫。全書敘述方式，乍看像是後現代拼貼，其實更貼近於班雅明 (Walter Benjamin) 在《商場研究計劃》(The Arcades Project) 裡的「文學蒙太奇」手法，語言極其簡潔，歷史知識、記憶 (透過敘述者或人物所傳達) 以及商品化景觀都以斷片方式出現，形成烘托、對位或反諷關係。我認為，這亦顯現後現代與後殖民的角力：九〇年代台灣一方面展現世紀末的奢華、後現代的擬真，另一方面則又面臨台灣國際地位愈發不利、本土化運動如火如荼，造成對台灣 (殖民) 歷史的重新閱讀和檢視，使得台灣認同漸漸浮升。本文將藉由探討《微醺彩妝》中的景觀、歷史書寫以及跨國與本土的辯證，探索書中後現代與後殖民之間的張力。

1. 從通俗文化開始

通俗文化 (popular culture) 的定義頗為紛雜，威廉斯 (Raymond Williams) 的《關鍵詞》(Keywords, 1976) 指出，通俗文化至少有四個意含：1. 被視為低下、沒價值的作品，亦即相對於精英或「高層」文化的東西；2. 刻意要贏得大眾喜愛的作品，亦即讓人消費的商業產品；3. 許多人所喜歡的事物或做法；4. 人民實際自己生產、為自己所生產的事物或做法 (Williams 237)。這些不同的定義使得「通俗文化」既包含來自草根的庶民文化 (folk culture)，也包含透過大量生產、分發、消費的大眾文化 (mass culture)，既包含被貶抑於精英文化之外低劣的文化產品，也包含許多人都喜愛的東西。也因此我譯為語意上比較含混的「通俗文化」，而非語意上較接近大眾文化的「流行文化」。

隨著歐美社會日益資本主義化，有關通俗文化的論述已由早期的貶抑、籠統演變為重視、專門。二十世紀三、四〇年代，英國的李維斯 (F. R. Leavis) 和德國法蘭克福學派 (Frankfurt School) 都捍衛高層文化，貶斥通俗文化。法蘭克福學派以阿多諾 (Theodor Adorno) 為首，認為通俗文化乃是統治階級強加於從屬階級、灌輸主流意識形態的文化工業，它經由標準化的商業模式生產，造成標準化的、同質性的消費。在七〇年代末期英國社會學學界，有一派也將「通俗文化」等同於「大眾文化」、「主流意識型態」，而與主張「通俗文化」是從屬階級草根文化 (截然不同於以大眾文化形式出現的主流意識型態) 的另一派發生論戰。班尼特 (Tony Bennett) 指出，雖然乍看針鋒相對，但不論哪一派，都認為主流意識型態是中產階級屬性，強加其意識型態於從屬階級上；且都把文化和意識型態場域看成分為中產階級和勞工階級對壘的兩個陣營，認為任何一階級都想宰制、瓦解另一方 (Bennett xiv)。班尼特不贊同兩派對通俗文化的兩極化看法。他認為如果改用格蘭契 (Antonio Gramsci) 的霸權理論：在資本主義社會裡，統治階級和從屬階級的關係比較不是宰制，而是霸權的取得，那麼通俗文化場域也同樣涉及霸權的取得 (Bennett xiv-xv)。班尼特指出，根據格蘭契的理

論，中產階級能夠成為霸權階級就在於它的意識型態能包容、協商對立階級的文化 and 價值；「中產階級文化」因此不再是純粹的中產階級，它混雜了來自不同階級位置的成分，形成了「統治階級文化與意識型態的協商版」(Bennett xv)。同理，通俗文化場域便不僅包含大眾文化或與之對抗的庶民文化、次文化，而更是兩者協商的地域，「在其中，主流、從屬與反抗的文化和意識型態價值與元素以不同的排列組合方式『混雜』」(Bennett xvi)。

海玲頓 (C. Lee Harrington) 和畢兒碧 (Denise D. Bielby) 亦有類似主張：通俗文化既非完全由統治階級強加於下，也非草根自然迸發出現，而是「生產與消費過程不斷互動的結果」(Harrington and Bielby 9)，至於消費者在消費過程裡主動創造了多少文化意義，此一主動性在與體制結構的關係上究竟是強而有力抑或邊緣，學者的看法則見仁見智 (Harrington and Bielby 9)。既然通俗文化是矛盾的社會關係的力場 (force field)，它與階級、性別、國家的關係也棘手複雜 (Bennett xiii, xvii)。而在台灣，通俗文化的族群意涵亦十分重要。我以為，正因為如此，不少九〇年代台灣小說描寫通俗文化與人物的關係，藉此呈現矛盾變動的社會關係。海玲頓和畢兒碧認為，通俗文化除了包括各種大眾娛樂的形式，也包含了構成我們日常生活經驗的信念與實踐，像「我們吃的食物、穿的衣服、相處的人、共享的八卦、旅行的道路等等」(Harrington and Bielby 2)。通俗文化包含如此廣泛，幾乎日常生活食衣住行娛樂的信念與形式無所不包，難怪它會成為小說家瞄準切入的目標。

《微醺彩妝》主要探討媒體、時髦人士、文化人和商人對流行的炒作，亦即屬於大眾文化的部分，但也觸及比較屬於庶民文化、具有族群意義的通俗文化，如棒球和民間宗教。而即使是流行，其背後往往有著原先的通俗文化傳統。書裡人物與通俗文化有著諸多不同的關係。以美食、紅酒的消費為例，一方面有跨階級的流動、協商，另一方面又有社會層級；一方面跨國，另一方面又有本土性。美食與紅酒受到不同階級的人們的喜好，但不同階級的人所選擇的美食與紅酒不同，賦予美食與紅酒的文化意義亦不相同。例如企業家二世祖王宏文的美食雅集講究排場、豪奢、品味，土洋佳餚並陳，呂之翔在報社的美食會則重視地方特色、鄉土風味，從基隆路邊攤吃到桃園深山泰雅族部落，從南投名間隧道旁吃到新竹峨眉山客家莊。王宏文以進口紅酒顯示華貴及文化涵養，呂之翔、前外交官唐仁的看法接近，但酒商洪久昌則認為公賣局的玫瑰紅投合大眾口味，而日本人以洋蔥泡紅酒有益健康之說已成風潮，才是引發大眾喝紅酒熱潮¹的主因。唐仁和洪久昌之間針對紅酒的階級和土洋之爭，顯現通俗文化乃是社會關係的力場。唐仁後來折服於洪久昌之見，但呂之翔只參加王宏文的美食雅集一回便不敢再自稱老饕，透露出跨階級的流動、協商，其方向並不一定。

書中對棒球熱的著墨則涉及了男性和國家認同，且棒球在戒嚴初期比較是

¹ 日本人洋蔥泡紅酒偏方其實是呂之翔在媒體上大事宣揚的結果，但它亦是針對台灣人原本不嗜酒的風俗，藉日本人的紅酒偏方說而與之協商。耐人尋味的是，這可能是有意地誤用日本人的紅酒偏方，廖炳惠指出：「日本人所泡的紅酒絕非台灣所泡的高級法國紅酒」(384-85)。

來自庶民的通俗文化，相對於外省人掌控的主流文化，具有複雜的族群意義。棒球從美國傳到日本，再傳到台灣。從日據到國府初期，棒球隊由原住民及閩客族群的球員組成，屬於外省人掌控的主流文化之外的本土傳統。謝仕淵、謝佳芬指出，在戒嚴時期早期，「眷村村口的克難球場，聚集著外省人打籃球，正如同在空闊土地上，操著一口日本式棒球術語的本省人在打棒球」(76)。本省棒球、外省籃球，前者說閩南語、後者說國語，成了難以跨越的二分。直到七〇年代以後，外省族群也參與棒球，「棒球才成為所有台灣人的共同認同」(謝仕淵和謝佳芬 76)。書裡描寫呂之翔屬於「那類深夜觀賽，對著電視機高喊『中華隊、加油』，打贏了，第一個跑出去放鞭炮的小孩」(81)。當呂明賜仍是亞洲巨砲時，他每天戴著球王簽名過的球帽，除了睡覺從不脫下，多少是藉著「被球王加持的球帽」(81)強調陽剛氣息。有一次他在舞場大跳迪斯可，遇上一位黑道大哥舞客挨近他，指著他的球帽豎起大拇指。² 此處有趣的是，它影射從六、七〇年代少棒拿到世界盃冠軍開始，棒球提高台灣在國際的能見度，在台灣外交迭遭挫折的時代凝聚了國族認同。高正源認為，它激起的國族激情甚至暫時彌合了族群創傷，1971年巨人少棒苦戰後奪得世界冠軍的那一刻，讓「二二八」的陰影首度被暫時拋開(高正源 182, 196)。³ 外省第二代的呂之翔因為沉迷棒球而跨族群地以呂明賜為偶像，顯示通俗文化也是族群協商的場域。

書中也處理了與女性有關的通俗文化，例如比較屬於大眾文化、受跨國資本主義影響的時尚、香水、化妝品，以及比較屬於庶民文化的民間宗教(尤其其中比較世俗化的命理)，前者為時髦女性如羅莉塔、葉香所熱中，後者則是絕望的家庭主婦吳貞女所乞靈，我將留到後面討論。農家女出身的報紙時尚版主編葉香既擦名牌香水，又穿上她認為可以改運避邪的紅色內衣褲，則顯現命理也開始成為大眾文化的一部分。《微醺彩妝》呈現了九〇年代通俗文化與階級、性別、國族的複雜關係，而這又涉及了書裡後現代與後殖民的張力。

2. 後現代景觀

後現代注重表層、感官、反本質、去中心、去歷史深度，強調身分流動及多元認同、異質、文化雜燴、都會中心，而後殖民則朝向抵殖民、本土化、重構國家和族群身分、殖民擬仿(colonial mimicry)、以及殖民與被殖民、都會與

² 這暗示連黑道也迷呂明賜，但也可能諷刺：尤其在職棒成立後，棒球運動沾染了黑道賭博。

³ 耐人尋味的是，高正源不以 1969 年金龍少棒或 1970 年七虎少棒拿到世界冠軍作為「二二八」陰影首度被暫時拋開的時刻，不知是否因為台灣在 1971 年退出聯合國，巨人少棒同一年拿到冠軍意義非比尋常？另一個可能性是：1969 年金龍少棒出賽時，觀眾席上「高舉『台灣不是中國』標語的台獨人士與[統派]『愛國青年』」發生衝突，「台獨團體醒目的白底紅字標語與旗幟，讓中華民國政府難堪到極點」(謝仕淵和謝佳芬 113)？換言之，少棒拿下世界冠軍所激起的國族認同對於不同族群不同國族立場的人其意義可能不盡相同。正如我在文章開始所討論的班尼特的理論(但需將他所說的主流中產階級和從屬勞工階級改為外省人掌控的主流文化和從屬的本土傳統)，這點反映外省人掌控的主流文化對於從屬的本土傳統的協商，使得棒球文化對於不同族群意義不盡相同。

邊緣之間的含混 (ambivalence)、交涉、挪用、翻譯。後現代的反本質、去中心有助於抵殖民，卻又不支持本土化、重構國家和族群身分；後現代的文化雜燴與後殖民的擬仿、含混看似雷同卻不然，因後者仍具歷史深度。《微醺彩妝》就在這兩條軸線之間來回交涉。一方面施叔青對於商人和半調子文化掮客的炒作、投機心理以及名流的粗俗誇富、頹廢享樂既嘲諷又著迷，描寫後現代台灣的景觀化、影像化，另一方面又對於個人生命史及有關地方、建築的歷史記憶念茲在茲，關注於後殖民歷史書寫。《微醺彩妝》對後現代景觀化既批判諷刺，又似乎犬儒認同。在這部分我將先討論書中對此的描寫，再借用班雅明在《商場研究計劃》裡對商品戀物主義 (commodity fetishism) 的觀點，探討施叔青對後現代景觀的雙重看法：一方面隱然認同其所蘊含的感官烏托邦，另一方面又藉著揭穿其虛幻與武斷性以及將其與疾病、失覺、死亡連結，讓資本主義內爆。

後現代景觀化在書裡以王宏文為代表。呂之翔以王宏文為偶像的歷程深受媒體商品化、景觀化的影響。先是八卦雜誌及電視上已頻頻介紹王宏文是台北社交圈名流，繼而呂之翔夤緣參加王宏文的美食雅集，親眼見識到王宏文的奢靡闊氣、唯美享樂，加深他對原先影像的迷戀，於是仿效王宏文到精品店買吊帶褲穿，傾倒於王宏文將吊帶褲、蝴蝶結搭配得無懈可擊，又感到王宏文的無框眼鏡配上腦後藝術家式的小辮子「實在夠酷、夠有型」(69)，更欣賞他接受電視訪問時「目中無人的坐姿」(69)。王宏文之所以成為名流，不僅仗著他財勢雄厚、可以有閒有錢地追求藝術品味，更在於他把自己和美食雅集景觀化，讓他的客人讚嘆喝了「液體黃金」(66)。猶如一些日本企業鉅子強調文化涵養，成為蘇富比拍賣會常客，自認繼承了白手起家父親的藝術氣息的王宏文也常跑國外，曾參加蘇富比拍賣作曲家安德魯·韋伯以及影星芭芭拉·史翠珊的收藏。他收藏世紀末克林姆金雕銀砌的畫，買下仿歐陸世紀末尊貴精緻的新藝術 (Art Nouveau) 大師奧圖·華格納風格的豪宅，讓客人嘆賞這「會是全台北最美麗的房子吧」(230)。當他買不成波爾多的酒莊，便在豪宅地下設置酒窖，並請來法國資深釀酒師跟他飛回台北親自指點。又特地從法國搜購名酒趁國民黨十五全舉辦名貴紅酒拍賣會，引發反對黨批為官商勾結。⁴ 王宏文不惜鉅資地賞玩名畫、展示豪宅、品嚐美食美酒，無疑是在台灣錢淹腳目後藉著奢華鬥富自我塑造為名流。

後現代景觀化又顯現在知識變成一種資本，人們只瞭解片段便琅琅上口，也是賣弄，也是被這些知識所建構，以晉身某種階級。富豪引法國《米其林餐飲指南》，報紙時尚版編輯引最新的香水資訊，酒商和時髦人士、媒體人引葡萄酒專書、世界衛生組織有關葡萄酒的報告，皆是樹立某種權威。品味也多來自學習品味手冊、模仿名流，因此有其虛假和武斷性。即使因旅歐多年而法語流利、看似具有真品味的羅莉塔，她口述的法國菜讓呂之翔垂涎欲滴，但當她展示設備無比齊全、但纖塵不染的廚房，卻又讓呂之翔懷疑她全套的鍋碗瓢盆不過只是擺

⁴王宏文的下一步會繼續做一個名流收藏家，抑或開始建立政商人脈、為逐步繼承父親事業佈局，尚不知曉。

設，她的烹飪手藝也許只是天花亂墜。⁵ 施叔青刻畫通俗文化背後的商業邏輯、名牌心理及社會階層與之的關係，諷刺媒體對流行的炒作，乃是一種後現代影像化的結果。媒體對流行的打造和推波助瀾扮演重要角色，尤其透過它所塑造的名流、文化精英和廣告。酒商邱朝川便請呂之翔幫忙，邀請一些文化人、時髦人士、廣告人在媒體上「鼓吹紅酒，使它成為九〇年代末期流行品味的象徵」(89)。

由於媒體與商業利益結合、操縱流行品味，媒體人往往是最趕時髦、深具階級流動性、深諳後現代景觀化的一群。呂之翔因在媒體工作、資訊靈通而吃遍台灣南北鄉土名菜，也藉媒體人身分參加名流的美食雅集。他曾以呂明賜為偶像，戴上球王簽名的球帽，取了呂之翔的筆名，直到呂明賜每下愈況才脫下球帽，驚覺比他晚出道的同事「都早已跑在他前面，穿名牌、戴名錶，每天吃香喝辣」(83-84)，於是轉到財經報，因為跑股票新聞而認識了當時還是證券公司老闆的邱朝川。他人面廣到結交羅莉塔、小玉等商場、歡場女子。由棒球熱，到名牌熱與股市狂飆，再到股市崩盤，再到美食熱、紅酒熱、健身熱、pub熱，呂之翔不僅體驗各種通俗文化形式的不同流行週期以及這些流行與台灣經濟的關係，在個人歷練上也翻了幾番。在最新的這波紅酒熱裡，他儼然自居文化人和時髦人士，以一個財經版編輯開授品酒班。但此時他已失去嗅覺，教人品酒成了裝模作樣、大言不慚的表演。失覺無感卻還能藉偽裝記憶和搬弄書本知識騙人，大大諷刺了所謂媒體大師對大眾品味的操弄。

作假、偽裝與媒體影像化、商品化有關，扣合了台北文化、社交圈愈來愈重視皮相的趨向，但這又搭連了以假亂真、真假不分、去除身分的後現代時尚趨勢，在設計上打破原有的階級劃分，造成跨階級的流動、協商。羅莉塔欣賞日本設計師山本耀司的男裝突顯「個人的主體性」(163)，讓穿的人的「真正身分無法被猜出，……讓人從服飾的符號解放出來」(163)。羅莉塔認為穿名牌服飾的驚喜即是「變成另外一個人」(163)，「擁有了新的生命」(163)。香港皮草店在全球保護動物運動壓力下將真皮草仿成假皮草穿，香奈兒的假珠寶比真珠寶售價昂貴則不但都以假亂真、真假不分，且顛倒了真與假的位階。

3. 後殖民歷史書寫以及跨國與本土的辯證

《微醺彩妝》處理九〇年代通俗文化，突顯了後現代的跨國性。台灣媒體對流行的炒作，乃是一種後現代影像化的結果，追求波西亞 (Jean Baudrillard) 所說的「符號價值」(sign value)，亦即消費就是將物品轉化為符號、並有系統地操縱這些符號 (1996)，而這與香奈兒、雅詩蘭黛的後現代時尚都指向了波西亞所說的「擬像」(simulacra)：真假不分、以假亂真 (1994)；與此同時也顯出

⁵ 比較女性主義的讀法則是：此處諷刺呂之翔是傳統男人，仍在找尋替代母親的女人，羅莉塔則是不能被「母性」、「擅於持家」等傳統價值所定義的新女性，就算擅於烹飪，她並不急於照顧他的口腹，反而用她宣稱的廚藝挑逗戲弄他。這種真假不明的挑逗性也連結到我下面談到的「微醺彩妝」的效果。

跨國文化的雜燴。王宏文的美食雅集端出的菜色是：香檳配烏魚子、勃根第紅酒配魚翅、夏多奈白酒配生魚片。王宏文的仿世紀末風格豪宅，脫離其歐陸脈絡，搭建於台北，則是後現代的復古。後現代的復古往往不會完全回到過去，而毋寧是風格上的模仿，甚至可能是擷取、挪用風格的某個面向的變奏。例如楊傳梓在日本福岡看到義大利和日本建築師聯合設計的「尊屋」，以後現代風格仿希臘神廟，以及因為「尊屋」成了按時計費的性交易大本營，令他聯想到的台北林森北路一棟希臘列柱式賓館。不論是「尊屋」或林森北路賓館的風格均顯出文化雜燴。不僅如此，在用途上兩者更反諷地將「神聖」、「尊貴」殿堂降格為色情旅館，此一顛轉混淆社會層級的劃分，打破高層文化與通俗文化的界線，乃是後現代的去中心。

然而如果《微醺彩妝》裡後現代是「擬像」、去歷史脈絡和深度、去身分本源的文化雜燴，書中另一條軸線則重建個人與集體的歷史記憶，而與前述的後現代軸線有所扞格。散佈於全書的諸多人物生命史，有關台灣許多地方、建築的記憶，以及從通俗文化角度對台灣歷史的一些反思，都讓人感到《微醺彩妝》的歷史書寫企圖。尤其它隱含從現今後殖民的角度回顧歷經多次殖民的台灣之歷史文化，不僅追撫歷史創傷，透露幽微嘲諷與無奈，也顯現台灣吸納殖民文化，呈現出巴巴 (Homi Bhabha) 所說的「殖民擬仿」(colonial mimicry) 的顛覆性。通俗文化再度成為交涉點。例如，從後殖民觀點，王宏文的美食雅集菜色 (香檳配烏魚子、勃根第紅酒配魚翅、夏多奈白酒配生魚片) 就不僅只是跨國文化的雜燴，而也是不自覺地對新、舊殖民主義所做的「既是/也是」(both/and)「既非/也非」(neither/nor) 殖民擬仿。因此，後現代和後殖民兩條軸線看似有些重疊，實則有許多角力：前者耽溺於景觀、表層、感官，後者探尋歷史脈絡及深度、重建不同族群歷史記憶；前者標舉去歷史脈絡的跨國文化雜燴，後者把跨國性放在歷史脈絡，而與本土認同形成辯證關係。兩條軸線的張力使得全書的敘述經常被打斷，造成斷片式的敘述。我以為這種斷片式敘述類似於班雅明的《商場研究計劃》裡文學蒙太奇手法。在這部分我將探討書中如何運用文學蒙太奇手法從事後殖民歷史書寫，並進行跨國與本土的正反合辯證。有趣的是，不論代表「跨國」或「本土」的人物在呈現上都著重他們的病症、空虛或不適應，而與敘述者比較正面的台灣中心歷史書寫形成微妙的對照。

在寫於 1930 年代的《商場研究計劃》裡，班雅明研究十九世紀的首都巴黎。就像撿破爛的人「回收被丟棄的廢物，再利用、流通」(Wollen 140)，班雅明在時間廢墟裡撿拾廢棄物，搶救被遺忘的物事，關切「過去如何被現在建構，透過現在解讀」(Gilloch 122)。班雅明發覺，對波特萊爾 (Charles Baudelaire) 而言，「落伍不流行的東西已無窮盡地承載了記憶」(354, J71, 2)。《商場研究計劃》採取斷片式書寫方式，充滿了對於繁多課題的札記、感想及引文，從商品、建築、政治思想、文學與藝術形式、工程等等不一而足。這些雜七雜八的斷片並置，造成「文學蒙太奇」的效果，班雅明自己說：「這個計劃的方法：文學蒙太奇。我不必說什麼。只要展示。我不偷貴重物，不挪用獨創的公式。就只讓碎布、廢物

——不一一列舉了——以唯一可能的方式顯出獨特性質：藉由使用它們」(460, N1a, 8)。這種看似不搭調、突兀的並置使得整個計劃以一種不斷辯證的方式推展，讓剛剛過去的十九世紀巴黎的亮麗奢華時時被現今的衰敗荒廢「去熟悉化」。《商場研究計劃》沒有寫完，無窮無盡的斷片既像是重建了十九世紀巴黎，也像是廢墟。沃倫指出，《商場研究計劃》顯示「歷史記憶和詮釋的過程乃是讓我們從限制我們瞭解現在以及未來行動的可能之桎梏裡掙脫，得到未來解放的先決條件」(Wollen 142)。

《微醺彩妝》的敘述也具有類似的文學蒙太奇效果。書中許多小節是以引文、報導開始，如六之2、十之2、十一之1、十三之1、十五、十六之2、十七之1、十八；而在許多小節內，敘述突然被某個像摘錄的「客觀」報導（可能是關於某種知識、訊息或歷史）打斷，例如一之2裡插入了人類學家對原始民族體味的研究，二之1插入有關台灣第一個飲食文化網站對中國歷史上美食家掌故的蒐集，四之1則從呂之翔戴棒球帽遇到黑道大哥插入「大哥的黑夜，比別人的白天還光明？」的問題，再跳到天文台對二十世紀最後一次日全蝕的預測以及黑道立委羅福助涉嫌一連串綁票、關狗籠等事件卻讓檢調單位束手無策時所說的名言。這類插入既像是小說人物的意識流或談話的摘錄，又像是敘述者旁觀介入後敘述上的意識流，其本體論的位置並不穩定。在小節之間或之內類似的打斷不勝枚舉，小說愈往下，斷裂和斷片感愈強。後現代主題與後殖民的歷史書寫主題交叉出現。不過《微醺彩妝》的碎裂度不及《商場研究計劃》；由於仍有清楚的敘述軸線，它並不像廢墟。

後殖民歷史書寫勢必處理跨國與本土的關係。阿帕度萊 (Arjun Appadurai) 指出，全球化的時代主要是個「流動的世界」(a world of flows)(2000: 5)，流動的事物包括「思想和意識型態，人民和貨物、影像和訊息、科技和技術」(2000: 5)。因此看似穩定的結構、組織、社會體制往往只是用來處理流動事物的裝置，連其中最重要的民族國家 (nation-state) 也受到流動事物的左右。或許由於台灣在地緣政治上的邊陲性，以及歷經多次殖民，迄今民族國家地位不被承認，在國際上妾身未明，台灣對於外來事物經常抱著開放、歡迎的態度，希望與世界接軌。《微醺彩妝》裡呈現，在某些人身上，這種開放性甚至已到了失去文化主體性的地步，於是出現對西方的「模仿過度」(廖炳惠 383)。阿帕度萊認為，在不同地區、國家和社會裡，形形色色事物的流動，其速度、軸線、起點與終點、以及與體制結構的關係皆不相同，造成一種「分離的關係」(relations of disjuncture)，進而在不同的在地情況 (local situations) 中產生種種有關生計、公平性和管理的問題與摩擦 (Appadurai 2000: 5)。《微醺彩妝》中，紅酒被去脈落地引進以及其所產生的種種在地現象和問題即可顯現「分離的流動」。由於商人不放過任何商機，但一窩蜂搶進導致市場混亂、自相殘殺，且造成流行暴熱之後泡沫化。而商人之所以一窩蜂投資又與媒體、時髦人士、政商名流、文化人的過度吹捧助長有關，這些鎖鏈結構讓一波波跨國流行被加乘放大，有如台灣股市的暴起暴落。

玫瑰紅背後的菸酒公賣制度傳統更有意思。公賣制度和棒球一樣都延續了日治時期的建制。根據范雅鈞的研究，原住民和閩、客本有飲酒習慣和農村的製酒技術，但直到日本殖民時期，1907年開始徵收「酒造稅」，民間酒業才成形，1922年實施酒專賣，「民間酒業又轉型成國家化的獨佔產業」（范雅鈞 10），以增加財政收入。1945年日本戰敗、國府接收，繼續日治時期煙、酒、樟腦、火柴、度量衡專賣制度，1947年陳儀政府查緝私煙之舉竟引爆「二二八」悲劇，首任台灣省省主席魏道明遂將「台灣省專賣局」改制為「台灣省菸酒公賣局」，成為省政府的重要財源，直到2002年為了加入WTO菸酒公賣制度才結束。《微醺彩妝》藉著洪久昌的談話以及敘述者報導曾是國府時期台北第一酒場的華山酒廠由日治到後來荒廢的歷史，側寫了公賣制度的興衰，又藉由描述藝術家探勘酒廠廢墟時所發現的日本九宮格式的牆和巴洛克式的窗暗示台灣承接日本現代性，並透過日本承接歐陸現代性，以此接續更早的西、荷殖民影響。類似的例子是書裡描寫日本皇軍大正二年所興建的北投公共浴場，其外觀為英國鄉村別墅，在荒廢多年後被台北市政府預定整建為溫泉博物館。

施叔青的文學蒙太奇技巧使她在報導與個人記憶之間轉換，把個人生命史放入地方誌或整個台灣歷史脈絡來看，強化了小說裡的後殖民歷史書寫主題。例如敘述者從回顧高雄鹽埕區自滿清、日治到國府八〇年代「風光的」酒家史(168)，再轉進洪久昌的家族從事酒吧業的歷史；從邱朝川對呂之翔回憶年少的赤貧歲月，再轉入美軍協防司令部在七〇年代末期撤走，「海霸王過去的一整排曾經是台北市最現代的建築，逐一被怪手夷為平地」(88)，並從建築上比較美軍和日本皇軍在台灣的際遇，再回到邱朝川與呂之翔的談話。這裡暗示的是國府接收台灣後靠著冷戰結構才能維持其大中國法統，也靠美軍協防台灣才維持台海安全，國府時期藉否定日本殖民歷史而對台灣再中國化，也藉此讓文化霸權掌握在外省人手裡、壓抑其他族群，但中國化不可能徹底，因它同時又擁抱美國文化帝國主義。而當台灣退出聯合國、台美斷交、美國與中共建交，在台灣的中國法統受到嚴厲挑戰，本土化成了必然趨勢。日本皇軍興建的北投公共浴場際遇好過於美軍協防司令部及相關建築，即借喻本土化與中國化的消長。

同樣的，書中五之1節，寓意深長地安排外交官唐仁在中南美洲小國遭中共用銀彈外交處境危急而萌生退意，返台正逢李登輝當第一任民選總統就職一週年紀念，中正紀念堂請來世界級男高音多明哥(Placido Domingo)、卡拉那斯(Jose Carreras)及美國黑人歌后黛安娜·露絲(Diana Ross)舉辦戶外演唱會。唐仁聽完演唱會又參加由西班牙駐台商務代表為卡拉那斯所辦的外交使節酒會，他感慨地看著以棕色、黑色膚色為主的駐台使節圈，想起日前碰到在台北使館夫人圈教授中國文化的童師傅，此人對照台灣尚未退出聯合國之前氣派的美國大使館和今日寒儉的中南美洲大使館，對台灣外交困境不勝唏噓。然而這也暗示台灣的大中國法統不論在國際和台灣都受到挑戰，使得原先被國府所壓抑的本土力量得以釋放。認同中國的唐仁和童師傅因此鬱卒。不僅李登輝當選第一任民選總統是民主化、在地化的指標，連資本與文化也不再以台北為中心。西班牙駐台

商務代表就發現：台灣願出高價買波爾多一級酒莊紅酒的行家集中在中南部，成為他推銷西班牙紅酒的重點。

五之 2 節，唐仁第一次和洪久昌見面，不無悵然地說自己已不是外交官，這時突然插入有關即將拆除的統一飯店的報導，以及唐仁對之的記憶，也頗具弦外之音。報導中說，統一飯店興建於六〇年代中期，創造了台灣觀光業奇蹟，「不僅成為東南亞政要下榻的賓館，也曾經是外交部設宴款待外賓的場所，甚至連蔣夫人也曾慕名造訪」(106)。統一飯店見證了國府到台灣後還佔有聯合國中國席次的外交最輝煌年代，那時在大中國教育下，「統一」理所當然；唐仁初入外交界曾與新婚妻子在此翩翩起舞，童師傅更是跟著飯店一路走來。統一飯店的拆除因此不僅象徵國府外交上的挫敗，也意味著在中共不斷打壓台灣下，「統一」不符合台灣利益，在台灣已失去了吸引力。

若再細究，吳貞女信仰的命理也含有外來佛教成分，顯現「本土」參雜了過往外來或殖民文化的積澱，已不具有純粹本源。畢竟台灣歷經了西、荷、日本甚至國府殖民，難以找到純粹、單一本源的本土文化傳統，雖然每一波外來文化進來時，都會產生本土與跨國二元對立。另一方面，台灣對跨國性的吸納不可能全面，而有其因排斥或誤解而產生的選擇性，再經過模仿、挪用和在地化。就以「國家飲食風格」為例，誠如廖炳惠指出，「往往與外來文化及其語碼產生牽扯，透過吸收與排外的方式，在模仿與『在地化』之後，轉變為本土社會實踐與民族文化特徵，這種錯綜複雜的認同疆域塑造過程，對台灣長期以來所累積的南島、中原、日本乃至其他殖民勢力而言，更是多重交錯」(378)。過往殖民勢力的影響，使台灣難以逃脫被西方文化霸權所形塑，後殖民思維讓我們對之反省，追求文化主體性，重視本土文化。另一方面，當我們批判缺乏地方關聯性的世界主義時，也不能毫不批判地擁抱本土文化，或甚至將跨國性全部打成西方文化霸權而抗拒之，因那不但淪於狹隘封閉的民族主義，且漠視了本土裡含納跨國的事實。本土與跨國需要持續細膩的辯證。《微醺彩妝》揭示的問題是：商人、媒體人、時髦人士對跨國流行的炒作偏重於符號性而非文化內涵，於是紅酒被勾連到暴發戶的豪奢或大眾的補藥，紅酒的文化內涵則被稀釋掉；此種對跨國性的吸收方式一方面連結到後現代的注重表層，另一方面毋寧也透露一種與歷史經驗有關、需要批判的本土性。另一方面，本土與跨國的辯證也應注意跨國如何含納本土，因全球化未必就只是西方霸權。根據阿帕度萊的說法，全球化的流動裡吸納了世界各地在地的成分，充滿異質性，挑戰西方權威 (Appadurai 1996)。《微醺彩妝》關注於台灣怎麼接收跨國流行文化，卻除了棒球外很少著墨於台灣如何發展在地文化形式，進入跨國流動，這似乎顯現施叔青的「本土轉折」在視野上仍有侷限。

巴巴曾指出：同質的國家文化、歷史傳統的連續傳遞、或「有機的」族裔社群等概念都在深深被重新定義的過程之中，大量證據顯示有「一種較為跨國、翻譯意義上想像社群的混雜」(Bhabha 5)。《微醺彩妝》顯示正因為台灣殖民歷史所造成的斷裂，不同族群、世代的歷史記憶大不相同，透過通俗文化的協商，存在著「一種較為跨國、翻譯意義上想像社群的混雜」。例如外省第一代大半反

日，但前面談過的棒球文化主要來自日本，在戒嚴早期曾是原住民、閩、客所屬的本土傳統，相對於外省人掌控的主流文化；卻在台灣退出聯合國後因為少棒打到世界冠軍而成為國族認同象徵，連外省第二代的呂之翔也認同。又如從飲食文化上來看，呂之翔不論是偏愛台灣南北各地小吃，或是讚嘆本省企業家第二代王宏文土洋雜燴的精緻美食，已截然不同於外省第一代母親為了重溫童年吃過的小吃而回蘇州老家探親。當他喪失嗅覺，失去食慾，他回的是永和竹林路老家，想要找回童年氣味。飲酒文化上，受到了日治時期開始的公賣制度影響，但進口紅酒熱造成的全國總動員則是九〇年代台灣社會誇富下產生的怪現象。而時尚文化則深受美、歐、日流行的左右，但仍有台北時髦圈與媒體所形塑的風格，例如羅莉塔戴假髮、葉香穿用以改運避邪的紅色內衣褲。

《微醺彩妝》的敘述者穿針引線，讓「現在」含納個人和集體記憶。如果像班雅明所說，時尚之可怕在於它加速社會遺忘，媒體所炒熱的話題、事件、商品，及各種壽命不過幾個月的後現代景觀也都如此。但書裡卻在嘲諷揶揄趕流行的人們追逐身分拔擢及縱情享樂之餘，又要說：透過這樣的媒體所塑造的公共文化，姑不論它多麼粗糙，新的想像社群已然建立。不只如此，如果媒體就像時尚，其本質是健忘的，那麼小說其實又銘刻了事件，搶救被快速遺忘的事物。更重要的是，敘述者具有說書人的意圖，因此她不只刻畫媒體操作下的後現代景觀，更藉由不同族群、世代、階層人物的現在與過去，以及地方誌和建築歷史，重建台灣的後殖民歷史記憶。

(本論文為國科會專題計劃 NSC 93-2411-H-002-030 成果之一，感謝廖勇超、周盈秀、黃山耘三位助理幫忙蒐集資料)

引用書目

- 王德威。1999。〈異象與異化，異性與異史——論施叔青的小說〉。《微醺彩妝》。台北：麥田。7-44。
- 朱天文。1992。〈世紀末的華麗〉。《世紀末的華麗》。台北：遠流。171-92。
- 。1994。《荒人手記》。台北：時報。
- 施叔青。1999。《微醺彩妝》。台北：麥田。
- 。2003。《行過洛津》。台北：時報。
- 范雅鈞。2002。《台灣酒的故事》。台北：貓頭鷹。
- 高正源。1994。《東昇的旭日：台灣棒球發展史》。台北：民生報。
- 廖炳惠。2001。〈後殖民的憂鬱與失感：施叔青近作中的疾病〉。《另類現代情》。台北：允晨。369-87。
- 謝仕淵和謝佳芬。2003。《台灣棒球一百年》。台北：果實。
- Adorno, Theodor and Max Horkheimer. 1986. *Dialectic of Enlightenment*. London: Verso.

- Appadurai, Arjun. 1996. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P.
- , 2000. "Grassroots Globalization and the Research Imagination." *Public Culture* 12.1 (winter): 1-20.
- Baudrillard, Jean. 1994. *Simulacra and Simulation*. Ann Arbor: U of Michigan P.
- , 1996. *The System of Objects*. Trans. James Benedict. London: Verso.
- Benjamin, Walter. 1999. *The Arcades Project*. Trans. Howard Eiland and Kevin McLaughlin. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Belknap P of Harvard University P.
- Bennett, Tony. 1986. "Introduction: Popular Culture and 'the Turn to Gramsci.'" *Popular Culture and Social Relations*. Eds. Tony Bennett, Colin Mercer, and Janet Woollacott. Milton Keynes: Open Univ. P. xi-xix.
- Bhabha, Homi. 1994. *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.
- Gilloch, Graeme. 2002. *Walter Benjamin: Critical Constellations*. Cambridge: Polity P.
- Harrington, C. Lee, and Denise D. Bielby. 2000. "Constructing the Popular: Cultural Production and Consumption." *Popular Culture: Production and Consumption*. Eds. C. Lee Harrington and Denise D. Bielby. Oxford: Blackwell. 1-15.
- Leavis, F. R. 1930. *Mass Civilization and Minority Culture*. Cambridge: W. Heffer & Sons.
- Williams, Raymond. 1983 (1976). *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*. Rev. edition. New York: Oxford Univ. P.
- Wollen, Peter. 2003. "The Concept of Fashion in *The Arcades Project*." *Boundary 2* 30.1: 131-42.

II. "Queer Theory and Politics in Taiwan"

This paper seeks to discuss queer theory and politics in Taiwan in terms of cultural translation, production, and reproduction. For this end but far from trying to be exhaustive, I will focus on issues such as gay/lesbian/queer movements, translating queer theory, naming, queer activists' co-operation with the media and popular culture, queer literature, queer activists' connection with postmodernism and postcolonialism, and queer studies in the academy. First I will begin with a brief history of the social

context that makes possible the rise of queer theory and politics in Taiwan. The 1990s saw Taiwan thriving on social movements and radical theories in the academy, when the lifting of the martial law in 1987 released democratizing energies and the economic growth since the early eighties had helped produce a consumer society. The opposition party, the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP), was legalized in 1986 and sought to challenge the authoritarian one-party rule of Kuomintang (KMT), or the Chinese Nationalist Party, partly by means of nativist mobilization. Historically Taiwan has undergone waves of colonization. Despite that the island has been mostly populated by Chinese settlers probably since the eighteenth century, it was largely ignored and marginalized by the Chinese rulers on the Mainland. In 1895, after losing a war, the Ching dynasty ceded Taiwan to Japan, which ruled it for fifty years until 1945, when Japan's defeat in World War II resulted in Taiwan's handover to Nationalist China. Emphasizing Chineseness and its representing the real China, the KMT enforced the use of Mandarin and banned both the local Minnan language and Japanese in 1946, thereby ousting native Taiwanese from the cultural institution. In 1949, after losing the Chinese Civil War to the Communists, the Nationalist Chinese government fled with its army to Taiwan and began to instill an anti-Communist ideology together with a harsh repression of political and cultural dissidence and a belief that the KMT will one day take back mainland China from the Chinese Communist Party.

However, China-centered policies had setbacks as Communist China superseded the Republic of China and took its seat at the United Nations in 1971.⁶ After the Formosa Incident in 1979 and the subsequent trials,⁷ which resulted in the

⁶ Thus Taiwan has virtually become an international pariah, with its nation-state status only recognized by a small number of countries.

⁷ Also called the Kaohsiung Incident, the Formosa Incident happened in Kaohsiung on December 10, 1979, when what started out as a peaceful rally celebrating International Human Rights Day planned by Formosa Magazine ended in chaos after police encircled the crowd and used teargas and pro-KMT

imprisonment of several political dissidents, the efforts at democratization and nativist resistance nonetheless gathered momentum. Then, as President Lee Teng-hui succeeded the late President Chiang Ching-kuo in 1990⁸ and as Taiwan recognized Communist Chinese regime in 1991, there was under way a gradual shift from pro-unification (or China-centeredness) to pro-independence (or Taiwan-centeredness) as far as Taiwan's political identity was concerned. The establishment of DDP, the lifting of the martial law, and the lifting of the ban on the founding of new newspapers in 1988 all point to the loosening up of political and cultural regulation of speech. On the other hand, the island basked in economic boom since the early eighties, accompanied by continuing urbanization and industrialization. It was a time of affluence and stability that also called for more open and pluralist cultures. Starting with the mid-eighties, the return of a number of First-World trained scholars, many of whom having a Ph. D. degree in English or Comparative literature, helped stir up radical thinking. As Ping-hui Liao observes, there was "an unconscious desire in Taiwan in the late 1980s to hope to understand the burgeoning social imaginary of Taiwan through correlative Western frameworks" (Liao 2000: 92). Social movements such as the Indigenous people's movement, the university students' movement, the feminist movement, and the environmental movement quickly flourished before and/or after 1987. Postmodernism was hot in the air following the visit of Fredric Jameson in 1986, while poststructuralism, postcolonial theory, new Marxism, feminist theory, and gay/lesbian/queer theory were welcomed in the academy since the early 1990s.

extremists incited violence. Moreover, three days later, the government used the event as an excuse to arrest virtually all prominent opposition leaders. Beginning publication in August 1979, *Formosa Magazine* quickly became a leading voice of dissent; even its name was defiant. Using the old Portuguese name for Taiwan was a subtle rejection of KMT's notion that Taiwan was part of China.

⁸ It was Chiang Ching-kuo who lifted the martial law in 1987 and nominated the native-born Lee Teng-hui as his successor. After Chiang died in 1988, Lee became the de facto leader of the country until he was formally sworn in in 1990. Lee then began a series of political reform in the 1990s.

Gay/lesbian/queer subcultures already existed in Taiwan before 1990 in unisex communities such as Taiwanese opera troupes, gay bars, *T-bars*,⁹ Taipei's New Park, and certain hotels, etc, though they remained largely invisible to the public. Chi Chia-wei was probably the only gay-rights activist prior to 1990, but his activism was limited to HIV/AIDS prevention. Another important gay figure was the well-acclaimed writer Pai Hsien-yung, whose roman-a-clef novel *Crystal Boys* portrays the underworld of homosexual prostitutes in Taipei's New Park and has been sensational ever since its publication in 1983. Though Pai, who taught at the University of California at Santa Barbara and who came out in 1994, far from advocating gay rights, the novel can be seen as pioneering gay/queer movement in Taiwan in that it presented a local homosexual subculture at a time when the Ideological State Apparatuses denied the existence of homosexuality in the society (see Liou 2003:195, 192-93). It is a novel that many invoked and reread in lesbian/gay/queer activism in the 1990s.

Lesbian and gay rights activism quickly flourished in the early 1990s when spurred on by the sudden introduction into Taiwan of lesbian/gay/queer theory and politics. This sudden introduction had a lot to do with the democratization ensuing the lifting of martial law in 1987, which allowed for a rethinking on issues of gender and sexuality. Lesbian and gay theory and politics were brought into Taiwan with an almost twenty-year temporal gap from their Western counterparts, and just a year or two ahead of the introduction of queer theory and politics. Lesbian and queer movements started out as branches within the feminist movement when the activists, unable to fully come out, joined the women's movement to secretly promote gay-positive consciousness, and they indeed succeeded in obtaining support from within the movement in the earlier stage. The first lesbian social and activist group

⁹ "*T-bar*" means "tomboy bar."

“Entre Nous”¹⁰ was founded in 1990 and the first gay activist organization, “Gay Chat,” a gay student society at National Taiwan University, was formed in 1993, while the first sign of an emerging queer movement took shape in the “Queer Special Issue” of the journal *The Isle Margin* in 1994 with Chi Ta-wei and Hung Ling as guest editors. Queer commentary, however, had already appeared earlier in Liang Nung-gung’s book *Pleasure and Sexual Difference* (1989) and Chang Hsiao-hung’s *Postmodernism/Woman* (1993).¹¹ The gay movement kept a lower profile for the activists could not disguise themselves as feminists. Since gay/lesbian/queer theory and politics were introduced into Taiwan at about the same time, the trajectories of the three movements are quite different from those in the West. Whereas the queer movement in the West was built on the success of the identity politics of the gay and lesbian movements, Taiwan gay, lesbian, and queer movements proceeded simultaneously with some of the activists working for more than one movement. Thus, the relationship between queer politics and gay/lesbian politics is quite different from that in the West. Fran Martin aptly observes that this “uncanny simultaneity” “suggests that the journey of lesbian, gay, and queer politics and theory follows the familiar pattern of disjuncture that Arjun Appadurai has argued characterizes cultural flow more generally in the era of globalization” (2003:17).

This simultaneity carries some cultural significance. Firstly, while the queer movement in the West leveled its critique more on the gay and lesbian movements than on the sexual politics of mainstream society, its counterpart in Taiwan shifted the stress for the simple reason that lesbian/gay identity politics had yet to take root. At

¹⁰ This name comes from the title of Diane Kury’s 1983 lesbian-themed movie. Starring Miou-Miou and Isabelle Huppert, the film portrays how two young, married women develop love relationship in desperate situations in postwar Lyon, France.

¹¹ Liang is a Hong-Kong-based film critic who is hardly known in Taiwan except for this book, whereas Chang is pioneering in introducing Western queer theory and applying it to Western literary texts in her next two books *Gender Crossing* (1994) and *Queer Desire, Gender, and Sexuality* (1997).

a time when most lesbians and gays could not even come out due to the overwhelming constraints of traditional family structure, few could stand up to claim their right. Although activism could still be engaged without individual coming out, as was the case in 1992 in which the coalition of lesbian/queer movements succeeded in forcing a TTV's¹² reporter to apologize for a homophobic news report in 1992, it posed some problem. In a public hearing on the human rights of gays and lesbians at the Legislative Yuan in 1993, for instance, self-declaring heterosexuals were commissioned by the lesbian and gay groups to speak for them and were troubled by the ethical problem of representation (Chu 2000: 9-10). Similarly, in a series of protest against the Taipei Municipal government's decision to convert Taipei's New Park into the 2-2-8 Memorial Park in 1996,¹³ the Gay/Lesbian/Queer Space Action Front adopted the so-called "collective coming out" strategy by donning masks in their parades. While the strategy, which underscores the collective identity of gays, lesbians, and queers without resort to individual coming out, invited criticism as to whether or not it would really contribute to gay-right activism,¹⁴ it enabled the activists to take on queerness by making it uncertain about the identity behind the masks. One can even say that, given the difficulty of coming out, queer politics became an especially enabling means for promoting gay-positive consciousness in Taiwan. Activists who practiced lesbianism or male homosexuality often took queerness (read: bisexuals or non-orthodox heterosexuals who either have had

¹² Taiwan Television Broadcasting Company was at that time one of the three TV channels in Taiwan.

¹³ In a way the conflict can be seen as having been an unfortunate clash between Taiwanese nationalism and the gay/lesbian/queer movement. Whereas the conversion represented a belated official recognition of the traumatic history related to the 2-2-8 Incident in 1947, and a commemoration of those killed as a result of it, it also symbolically erased the memories of the park as a space of male homosexual public sex in the past. Though the decision was not overturned, the protests successfully revived public memories and showed gay/lesbian/queer solidarity.

¹⁴ While Chang Hsiao-hung is positive that the strategy was enabling in stressing the gay/lesbian/queer subjectivity (1996b), Lin Hsien-hsiu and Antonia Chao criticize the strategy as making it harder for the public to affirm gays, lesbians, and queers. Masking, argue Lin and Chao, seems to subject gays, lesbians, and queers to the social order which does not want to see them except in heterosexual masks (Martin 1998: 133).

heterosexual relationship before or keep open their future sexual object-choice) as camouflage for their identity in either the feminist movement or the media in order to elude confrontation with homophobia and heterosexism in person. This probably led Huang Tao-ming to argue that, for him in 1994, “queer,” “gay,” and “lesbian,” were all synonyms of “homosexual” (Huang Chu-hsiung 59). Some claimed that the strategy of “collective coming out” is at least a necessary tactic to challenge the mainstream society and achieve an early-stage success in activism.

I have mentioned earlier that the queer movement in the media is often seen as playful elitism characterized by postmodern verbal play and a poststructuralist critique of identity. Some queer activists are indeed affiliated with postmodernism by deliberately associating queerness with postmodern de-centeredness, hybridity, anti-foundation, heterogeneity, fluidity, and performativity. Thus, all the neologisms and appropriations of words that the queer activists relish are supposed to project an avant-garde image that is both subversive and seductive. It is as if, equipped with their cultural capital, they can fight homophobia and heterosexism on their own terms, with the verbal play projecting a utopia where queer desire is ubiquitous and queer politics embraced by the avant-garde or the most progressive people in society. They flirt with the media, popular culture, and consumerism in the belief that in the late-capitalist world they can only intervene in and subvert the social imaginary through making their presence felt in that way. This tactic indicates a desire to achieve goals within the shortest time and proves to be exceedingly successful in transforming the public discourses on sexuality. That Chi Ta-wai and Hung Ling, the two most prominent writers of queer-themed literature, use sci-fi, metafiction, and, in the case of Hung Ling, vampire fiction in their writing carves out a postnational, postmodern, generation XXX’s image of queerness in public culture. Both the fluid, transgressive (and sometimes deliberately perverted) sexuality and mutations of

identity in which their fiction abounds are meant to shock the ordinary reader by challenging the latter's notion of fixed heterosexual and homosexual identities and sensibility on the issue of sexuality (see Liou 1998a).

On the other hand, queer activists also seek to connect with postcolonialism. This stems partly from their awareness of the foreignness of queer theory and the importance of the politics of location in thinking about the global flow, and partly from their efforts to produce gay/lesbian/queer communities. While the neologisms and appropriation of words can be seen as re-articulations of queer theory in the local context, it is also interesting that the Minnan terms are used to translate "camp" and "bring out." Earlier I have mentioned that this signals efforts on the part of the queer activists to connect with the nativist resistance. And this probably also signifies a reconciliation after the lesbian/gay/queer movement's clash with Taiwanese nationalism over the conversion of Taipei's New Park into the 2-2-8 Memorial Park. But prior to that incident, Chi Ta-wei seemed to have either been inspired by the nativist challenge to Chinese colonialism or sought negotiation with postcolonialism by drawing on Chiu Kuei-fen's notions of decolonization in her article "Discovering Taiwan" in order to assert lesbian/gay identity (1998: 138-9).¹⁵ He argues that the subjectivity of lesbians and gays is just as unquestionable as that of Taiwan. On the part of the nativists, it is also noteworthy that the first Taiwanese novel with a heavily lesbian element, *The Silent Thrush*, by Ling Yen, which depicts life among a Taiwanese opera troupe, was published by the nativist Independence Evening News

¹⁵ Chiu's paper was first presented at a conference in 1992 and published in the *Chung-wai Literary Journal* in 1993, while Chi's paper was first presented at a conference in 1995. Concerning Chiu Miao-jin's satiric use of the crocodile as the trope for stigmatized lesbian/gay identity in her novel *Notes of the Crocodile* (1994), Chi remarks that "'Discovering the crocodile' is just as ridiculous as 'discovering the New World' or 'discovering Taiwan,' since the 'discovered object' had already existed as the 'subject,' had indeed existed absolutely without relying on external forces" (1998: 142).

Publication Company in 1990 and won the newspaper's Million-Dollar Novel Prize in 1991. After the gay/lesbian/queer activists' clash with the nativists in 1996, both Cheng Mei-li and Huang Tao-ming appropriate the postcolonial scholar Benedict Anderson's notion of the "imagined community," which is often cited by postcolonial scholars in Taiwan, to address the construction of a lesbian (for Cheng) and a gay (for Huang) community (Cheng 119, Huang 111).¹⁶ While postcolonial ideas are useful for the construction of lesbian and gay identity, they are also enabling in helping the queer activists to find their bearings. Rather than simply a slavish translation of Western queer theory and politics, the activists and theorists adapt and indigenize them for the specific local context. Chi Ta-wei, in editing the first queer reader, uses the English title "Queer Archipelago" in reference to the geographic contours of Taiwan and states that *ku-er* as a cultural hybrid is engaged in both writing a local history of queerness and having an ongoing dialogue with queerness from abroad (Chi 1997b: 18, 11).

As for queer studies in the academy, aside from anthropological studies and sociological studies that I have discussed above, literary studies are also important in promoting same-sex desire, critiquing the institutions of compulsory heterosexuality and family, exploring the strategies of activism, and cultivating the queer readers. While Chang Hsiao-hung's literary studies focused mainly on English and American texts and pioneered queer studies in Taiwan, Liou Liang-ya endeavored to establish a Taiwan lesbian/gay/queer literary canon in her two books *Engendering Dissident Desires* (1998) and *Gender, Sexuality, and the Fin de Siecle* (2001).¹⁷ Liou argues

¹⁶ Fran Martin, too, adapts Benedict Anderson's idea to argue that, through the reception and interpretation of literature with gay, lesbian, or queer themes, there is "a kind of 'imagined community' of queer readers that developed a strong understanding of itself as such during the 1990s" (2003: 6).

¹⁷ Fran Martin's introduction to her translation *Angelwings* (2003) is also an attempt at establishing a Taiwan lesbian/gay/queer literary canon, though it is addressed to the reader in the English-speaking world.

that, due to its nuanced portrayals of the lives of gays, lesbians, and queers, particularly in regard to affect and subject formation, fiction with such themes can often unravel issues that queer activism does not address. In her studies on Chiu Miao-jin's complicated *Notes of the Crocodile*, for instance, she discusses how the protagonist's self-loathing stems from the trauma she had suffered from growing up as T-lesbian—hence it can serve as a critique on the politics of sexuality in mainstream society--and how the self-loathing combined with her sexist attitudes toward her lover leads to a most painful love relationship (Liou 1998b; 2004). That the protagonist's hilarious satire on the heterosexist society's homophobic voyeurism eventually leads to her melancholia and suicide, argues Liou, constitutes a powerful critique on the system (1998b). Liou's analysis of the various lesbian couples in Taiwanese fiction since 1975 deals with the *T-Po* and *bu-fen* relationships in *and beyond* T-bars, university campus, and feminist groups, in terms of subject formation, self-perception, and power relations (Liou 2001c). Chang Chih-wei's sophisticated queer reading of Chu Tien-wen's *Notes of a Desolate Man* shows the proliferation of meanings in the textual cross-pollination that transgresses even the anxiously closeted gay narrator's conservative thoughts. And Yeh Te-shuan in his study of *Crystal Boys* precedes Cheng Mei-li in pointing out that familialism is the primary institution that oppresses lesbians, gays, and queers in Taiwan since it perpetuates homophobia and heterosexism. In their article on the lesbian novel *A Bad Daughter* by Tu Hsiu-lan, Ding Nai-fei and Liu Jen-peng critique the traditional poetics of reticence as used by the dominant society to condemn and silence lesbianism. Generally speaking, since the mid-1990s, queer literary studies have clustered around three texts: *Crystal Boys*, *Notes of a Desolate Man*, and *Notes of the Crocodile*, so that these texts are established not only as the classics of Taiwanese gay/lesbian/queer literature, but as texts that queer readers will respond to, interpret, or appropriate.

One of the key theories flourishing both in Taiwan's cultural and academic scene in the 1990s, queer theory has helped transform the public discourse on sexuality and gender. To have queer theory and gay/lesbian theory translated to Taiwan almost at the same time is to contribute to gay-positive awareness with more resourceful tactics, to generate a carnivalesquely gay-friendly atmosphere, to address the differences within lesbians and gays, and to even break down the homosexual/heterosexual divide almost from the beginning. By connecting with the media, popular culture, and postmodernism, queer politics have succeeded in presenting itself as at once the avant-garde and the most progressive and trendy at the cultural front. But queer politics also find the need to connect with postcolonialism by tracing the history of local gay/lesbian/queer communities and cultivating new ones, and by thinking about the transnational politics of translation. The translation of queer theory is always already indiginized for the specific needs of the lesbian/gay/queer movements in Taiwan in the 1990s. And the success of the lesbian/gay/queer movements within a very short time is indicative not only of the dynamic, pluralist cultural atmosphere right after the lifting of the martial law in 1987, but also of the resourcefulness of the activists in cultural production of queerness.

References

- Chang, Chih-wei. 1997. "Homosexual Voices and Homonymic Desires: Chu T'ien-wen's *Huang-jen-Shou-chi*." *Chung-wai Literary Monthly* 25.10 (March): 160-79.
- Chang, Hsiao-hung. 1993. *Postmodernism/Woman*. Taipei: Shih-pao.
- , 1995. *Gender Crossing*. Taipei: United Literature.
- , 1996a. *Queer Desire, Gender, and Sexuality*. Taipei: United Literature.
- , 1996b. "Queer Politics of Desire." *Chung-wai Literary Monthly* (June): 6-25.
- Chao, Antonia. 2000. "A Retrospective and Prospective View of Taiwanese Lesbian/Gay/Queer Studies." *Cultural Studies in Taiwan*. Ed. Kuang-hsing

- Chen. 237-79.
- , 2001. "Drink, Stories, Penis, and Breasts: Lesbian Tomboys in Taiwan from the 1960s to the 1990s." *Journal of Homosexuality* 40.3-4: 185-209.
- Chen, Shueh. 1995. *Evil Woman*. Taipei: Ping-shih.
- , 1996. *Sleepwalking in 1994*. Taipei: Ping-shih.
- Cheng, Mei-li. 1997. *Daughters' Circle*. Taipei: Fembooks.
- Chi, Ta-wei. 1995. "Queer Diaspora: A Queer Reading of *Notes of a Desolate Man*." *Chung-wai Literary Monthly* (Aug 1995): 153-60.
- , 1995. *Queer Senses*. Taipei: Ping-shih.
- , 1996. *The Membrane*. Taipei: Ping-shih.
- , ed. 1997a. *Queer Archipelago: A Reader of the Queer Discourses in Taiwan*. Taiwan: Yuan-tsuen.
- , 1997b. "Introduction: On *ku-er--*Contemporary Taiwan Queerness and Queer Literature." *Queer Archipelago: A Reader of the Queer Discourses in Taiwan*. Taiwan: Yuan-tsuen. 9-16.
- , 1998. "Discovering the Crocodile." *Sexually Dissident Notes from Babylon*. Taipei: Tan-suo. 137-54.
- Chien, Chia-hsin. 1997. *Bringing Out Lesbians*. Master's thesis. National Taiwan University.
- Chiu, Kuei-fen. 1997. "Discovering Taiwan." *Reading Taiwan/Woman*. Taipei: Yuan-tsuen. 153-77.
- Chiu, Miao-jin. 1994. *Notes of the Crocodile*. Taipei: Shih-pao.
- Chu, Tien-wen. 1994. *Notes of a Desolate Man*. Taipei: Shih-pao.
- Chu, Wei-cheng. 2000. "Postcolonial Thoughts on Taiwan tong-chi Movement: the Problem of 'Coming Out.'" *From Queer Space to Educational Space*. Ed. Josephine Ho. Taipei: Ryefield. 1-25.
- Ding, Nai-fei, and Jen-peng Liu. 1998. "Reticent Poetics, Queer Politics." *Working Papers on Gender/Sexuality Studies* nos. 3 & 4 (September 1998): 109-55.
- Huang, Chu-hsiung. "Displaying Queer Monstrosity: the Minutes of the Colloquium on the 'Monstrous Speech' for Queer/Lesbian/Gay and Women's Desire." Special Issue on "Queer Politics and Queer Theory." *Working Papers in Gender/Sexuality Studies* 3& 4 (Sept. 1998): 47-87.
- Huang Tao-ming 2000. "Interpellating the Homosexual—Nicknames, Stigmata, and the Signification of Taiwan Gay Culture." *Sexual Politics and Subject Formation*. Ed. Josephine Ho. Taipei: Ryefield. 111-29.
- Hung, Ling. 1995a. *Beast*. Taipei: Ping-shih.
- , 1995b. *Chronicles of Heretic Vampires*. Taipei: Ping-shih.

- Lai, Cheng-che. 2000. "Working for the Company—A Study on the Taipei' s New Park as a Location for *nan-tong-chi'* s Performance." *Sexual Politics and Subject Formation*. Ed. Josephine Ho. Taipei: Ryefield. 131-86.
- Liang, Nung-gung. 1989. *Pleasure and Sexual Difference*. Taipei: Yuan-liu.
- Liao, Ping-hui. 2000. "Taiwan: Postmodern or Postcolonial?" *Writing Taiwan: Literary History, Postcolonialism and Postmodernism*. Eds. Cho Ying-hsiung and Liu Chi-huei. Taipei: Ryefield. 85-99.
- Ling, Yen. 1990. *The Silent Thrush*. Taipei: Independence Evening News Publication Company.
- Liou, Liang-ya. 1998a. *Engendering Dissident Desires: The Politics and Aesthetics of Erotic Fictions*. Taipei: Yuan-tsuen.
- , 1998b. "Eroticism, Gender, and Writing: Miao-jin Chiu' s Lesbian Fictions." *Engendering Dissident Desires: The Politics and Aesthetics of Erotic Fictions*. 111-52.
- , 2001a. *Gender, Sexuality, and the Fin de Siecle: Studies in Erotic Fictions*. Taipei: Chiuko.
- , 2001b. "Voicing from the Margin: Taiwanese Lesbian/Gay/Queer Fiction since 1987." *Gender, Sexuality, and the Fin de Siecle*. 79-112.
- , 2003. "At the Intersection of the Global and the Local: Representations of Male Homosexuality in Fictions by Pai Hsien-yung, Li Ang, Chu Tien-wen, and Chi Ta-wei." *Postcolonial Studies* 6.2 (July 2003). 191-206.
- , 2004. "Ghost-writing: Trauma and Queer Performativity in Taiwanese Lesbian Fiction." *Chung-wai Literary Monthly* 33.1 (June): 165-83.
- Martin, Fran. 1998. "Closets, Masks and Membranes: The Homosexual Subject's *Yin/Xian* Logic in Contemporary Taiwan Discourse." Trans. Ta-wei Chi. *Chung-wai Literary Monthly* (May 1998): 130-49.
- , 2003. "Introduction: Taiwan's Literature of Transgressive Sexuality." *Angelwings: Contemporary Queer Fiction from Taiwan*. Trans. Fran Martin. Honolulu: U of Hawaii P. 1-28.
- Ning, YinBin. 1997. "What Is 'Queer'?" *Queer Archipelago: A Reader of the Queer Discourses in Taiwan*. Ed. Chi Ta-wei. Taipei: Yuan-tsuen. 231-43.
- Pai, Hsien-yung. 1983 (1973). *Crystal Boys*. Taipei: Er-ya.
- Tsao, Li-chuan. 1999. "Maiden Dance." *Maiden Dance*. Taipei: Ta-tien. 12-49.
- , "Regarding Her White Hair and Other Matters." *Maiden Dance*. 98-174.
- Tu, Hsiu-lan. 1996. *A Bad Daughter*. Taipei: Ping-shi.
- Yeh, Te-hsuan. 1995. "The Haunting Specter of Familialism: A Discursive Analysis of

Some Commentaries on *Crystal Boys*.” *Chung-wai Literary Monthly* (December 1995): 66-88.

(五) 計劃成果自評：

本計畫 91 年度完成了有關台灣女同性戀創傷書寫研究，研究成果的英文版“Ghost Writing: Trauma and Queer Performativity in Taiwanese Lesbian Fiction”初稿發表於 2003 年 3 月 15 日中興大學台灣人文研究中心主辦的「邊緣再思：文化、傷痛、再現」國際學術研討會，定稿發表於 2004 年 6 月 18 日舉辦的國際比較文學會議，且已通過 Tamkang Review 審查，將刊登於 2005 年 3 月號。中文版〈鬼魅書寫：台灣女同性戀小說中的創傷與怪胎展演〉刊登在《中外文學》33 卷 1 期（2004 年 6 月）：165-83。92 年度完成了〈辯證復振的可能：舞鶴《餘生》中的歷史記憶、女人與原鄉追尋〉一文，2003 年 10 月 18 日發表於政大中文系主辦之「二十世紀臺灣男性書寫的再閱讀——完全女性觀點」學術研討會。並已刊登在《中外文學》32 卷 11 期（2004 年 4 月）：141-63。93 年度計劃探討女性創傷與通俗文化。成果包括兩篇學術論文及我替《中外文學》33 卷 7 期（2004 年 12 月）主編的專輯「跨國文化與台灣文學」。兩篇論文第一篇探討是施叔青小說《微醺彩妝》，題目是〈後現代，還是後殖民？：《微醺彩妝》中的景觀、歷史書寫以及跨國與本土的辯證〉，已發表在《中外文學》33 卷 7 期（2004 年 12 月）：77-101。第二篇則是英文論文“Queer Theory and Politics in Taiwan”〈酷兒理論與政略在台灣〉，發表在 2005 年 1 月 22 日 UCLA 所辦的“Translating Universals: Theory Moves Across Asia”國際學術研討會。有關參加此學術會議的心得報告請參看本報告的第三部份。整體看來，成果十分豐碩。由於這是三年期整合型計劃，我得以有機會與「邊緣再思」其他成員簡瑛瑛、邱貴芬、廖朝陽、廖炳惠、單德興互相切磋，並一起參加兩次國際學術研討會，這些歷練擴展了我的學術視野，也增加了我的論辯能力。較諸我過去的文章，我在這計畫裡所完成的文章在理論、歷史脈絡及文本分析上結合得更理想，也因此更具深度。