WORKING IN A NEON CAGE:

BODILY LABOR OF COSMETICS SLAESOWMEN IN TAIWAN

PEI-CHIA LAN

Contemporary capitalism is characterized by its obsession with and anxiety about the body. With a never-ending expansion of commodities and services in dieting, slimming, and skin care, consumer culture encourages individuals to combat the deterioration of the body, a proclaimed vehicle of pleasure and self-expression.[1] Feminist studies have further pointed out the gender significance of the beauty culture. The mainstream media and the beauty industry discipline female consumers by reproducing the dominant ideal of femininity in connection with the contemporary body discourse of self-control.[2] One missing piece of the puzzle in the above analysis involves women who are not only consumers themselves but also employees in the beauty industry—they are hired to embody beauty images and convey normalizing discourses to customers on the selling floor.

Through a case study of cosmetics saleswomen working in department stores in Taiwan, this article examines the making of gendered bodies and subjects in the nexus of labor, production, and consumption. Lauren Langman describes the department store as a "neon cage" that symbolizes how consumer society organizes our time, behavior, and subjectivity.[3] I borrow this metaphor in a broader sense to designate the multiple layers of control over workers who sell products or provide services related to the cultural ideal of body. Working in a shopping space rampant with images and desire, these workers' bodies are not only subjected to the supervision of managers but also under the surveillance gaze

of customers. While these workers embody and promote beauty images at work, their own desire, body image, and personal consumption are integrated into the intrinsic elements of the labor process.

I propose the concept of "bodily labor" to analyze the ambiguous nature and multiple dimensions of the labor process of selling cosmetics. I explore the following questions in this article: What are the job requirements for cosmetics saleswomen hired to produce beauty images and manipulate consumer desire? How are their bodies and identities constructed as an integrate part of the labor processes? How do these women accomplish and resist the requirements of bodily labor? How do they negotiate their gender and class identities when working in a shopping space that promotes an ideal femininity and a middle-class lifestyle? I identify three different components of the job requirements for cosmetics saleswomen: *the disciplined body*, *the mirroring body*, and *the communicative body*. The tripartite components of bodily labor involve diverse strategies of labor control, conveying contradictory messages to customers. The performance of bodily labor also becomes a battleground for saleswomen to negotiate their gender and class identities on a daily basis.

Bringing The Body Back In

As the famous 1960s' slogan "our bodies, ourselves" declares, the body has always been a key concern in the history of Anglo-American feminism. In the 1990s, the signification of the body is debated in the wake of "the linguistic turn." Poststructuralist feminists have challenged the sex/gender distinction, which leaves the "sexed" biological body as a kind of "coat rack" upon which the social construction of "gender" is expressed.[4] Scholars such as

Judith Butler argue that women are neither born, nor made; women appropriate the normative prescription on sex, according to which their bodies are shaped, cultivated, and constructed. This approach, however, faces the criticism that it reduces the body as a textual play designating semiotic differences, thereby owing justice to the materiality of the body.[5]

This debate indicates a broader concern in contemporary feminist theories, that is, as Nancy Fraser phrased it, a disconnection between the "discursive analysis of gender signification" and the "structural analysis of institutions and political economy."[6] Given that most feminist scholarship on the body is devoted to the analysis of media images and cultural discourses over female consumers, I suggest an alternative research direction which focuses on the gendered body in the nexus of labor, production, and consumption. This focus explores how gender and sexuality become the integral elements of the service labor process, in which the worker's body is constructed as a productive subject as well as a sexual object governed by gender discourses and consumer culture.[7]

In the literature of labor process theory, the traditional image of a worker is as an abstract labor power that has no sexuality, emotion, or body. Its gender-blindness has been challenged by many feminist studies that uncover how gender difference and inequality are constructed and perpetuated from structural segregation to daily labor performance.[8] However, the gendered embodiment of workers has yet to be thoroughly examined. The missing body is a serious flaw particularly in the study of service work, whose characteristics break down the old dichotomy of mental labor and physical labor, a replication of the Cartesian mind/body dualism.

Recent scholars have offered insights on the specificity of the service labor process

and how workers are, in Candace West and Don Zimmerman's words, "doing gender." Arlie Hochschild uses the concept of "emotional labor" to describe how service workers are required to produce particular emotions in customers and how their feelings become controlled by employers through training and supervision. Through a comparison of female attendants and male bill collectors, she further argues that whereas women occupy the feminine side (caring, sympathy, deference), men are usually assigned to the masculine type of emotional labor (threatening, no sympathy, truth claiming). Robin Leidner defines "interactive service work" as the jobs that require workers to directly interact with customers or clients. She also found that fast-food counter workers (mostly women) accord with stereotypical feminine characteristics when submissively serving customers and taking orders, but the work scripts of insurance sales (used mostly by men) emphasize heroism, aggressiveness, and domination over clients.[9]

Although these scholars have shed light on how service workers interact with customers through facial expressions and bodily gestures, the significance of the body in the service labor process is not yet sufficiently theorized. Further, I raise the concept of "bodily labor" to describe service jobs with three characteristics. First, the services provided or products sold by the workers involve consumption related to the cultural ideals of body. Second, the main job content of these workers includes the use of bodily postures, expression, display, and movements to interact with customers. Third, labor management focuses on the discipline, maintenance, and transformation of workers' bodies.

Because the body is fundamental to the construction of gendered selves in contemporary societies, gender is an integral part of bodily labor. Debra Gilman coins the term "body work" to describe how women negotiate gendered identity by transforming

their bodies through hair styling, aerobics, and plastic surgery.[10] However, such body work cannot be accomplished without the assistance of workers in the beauty industry—hair stylists, aerobics instructors, and cosmetics surgeons. Their bodily labor normalizes the dominant body images and reproduces the cultural meanings of femininity and masculinity during their encounters with consumers.

The concept of bodily labor contributes to labor process theory by examining workers' embodied subjectivity in the beauty industry. Drawing on Michel Foucault,[11] I look at labor control not only as repressive violence related to the appropriation of surplus value, but also as a productive and discursive exercise to make workers into appropriate subjects. Capitalists who purchase bodily labor to promote the cultural ideal of body want their workers to be productive, docile, and tractable bodies. Workers' bodies become a means of conveying consumer images and normalizing discourses to customers, as well as a target of management, discipline, and transmutation.

Research Methods

My data collection was conducted in Taipei mainly between October 1994 and May 1995. A brief period of follow-up research was carried out in the summer of 1998. The main research methods were field observations, in-depth interviews, archival analysis, and a small-scale survey. Although I did not get a chance to work on the site, through an insider contact (one saleswoman who was my high school classmate), I hung out at a cosmetics counter on a regular basis. I observed the employees' daily work and interactions with customers, chatted with them when no customers were around, had lunch, and socialized with other saleswomen from neighboring counters. My research purpose was known by the

saleswomen but not the managers, a decision made under the suggestion of some saleswomen (“That would be too much hassle. You may be kicked out.”) When the manager or supervisor occasionally showed up, I disguised myself as a customer browsing around at the counters.

I also conducted open-ended interviews with twelve saleswomen and two salesmen during their lunch breaks or off-hours. At the time of interviews, seven worked at the same department store where I observed, four worked in other department stores, and two had left this occupation. The informants were selected based on snowballing and theoretical sampling to cover enough variations in marital status, age, and company. Among the ten women who were working in sales, only one was older than thirty; three were married, two had children, and the rest were single. The two informants who had left this occupation were both married, over thirty-five years old, and had children. All the saleswomen interviewed were high school graduates. One salesman was in his early thirties and had a junior college degree. The other salesman was only nineteen years old; he was attending college in the evening. Later in the research process, I interviewed two female managers of cosmetics companies and one male department store supervisor. The work experiences of all the informants cover eight different cosmetics companies. All interviews were conducted and transcribed in Mandarin Chinese and later translated into English when quoted. All names used in this article are pseudonyms.

In addition, I coded articles and advertisements in recent Taiwanese fashion magazines regarding beauty culture and cosmetics products. I also widely collected Training manuals, working rules, recruitment classified ads, and other relevant archival material. At the end of my research, I conducted a small-scale survey with 28 saleswomen in the department store

I had observed to double-check my field findings.

The following analysis is divided into four parts. First, I document the development of the cosmetics industry and the transformation of body discourses in Taiwan. Second, I identify three types of bodily labor in the job requirements of cosmetics saleswomen. Third, I explore how saleswomen accomplish bodily labor in different ways to negotiate their gender and class identities. And fourth, I present a case of men selling cosmetics to underscore the construction of hierarchical gender difference in the performance of bodily labor.

The Cosmetics Industry in Taiwan

The cosmetics industry in Taiwan has rapidly grown in the past four decades in keeping with the development of Taiwan's economy. Before the 1960s, only a few small local factories produced a limited variety of traditional cosmetics products. Due to the agricultural lifestyle and modest economic conditions then, most women neither needed nor could afford these luxuries. Women wearing heavy make up were often associated with "bad women," which carried an implicit reference to prostitution. In contrast, the body image of "good women" featured plain faces and straight long hair; their chastity and morality were sound without the "blemish" of makeup and hair perms.

Some U.S. and Japanese cosmetics companies started establishing local franchises in Taiwan in the early 1960s. The cosmetics market rapidly expanded in the 1970s because the growth of the gross national product raised the average ability of consumption, the industrialization dramatically increased women's wage work, and the physical and cultural boundaries of Taiwanese women's daily lives were redefined.[12] Foreign cosmetics

companies drew on distinct cultural elements to rewrite local discourses about makeup. Max Factor diffused Caucasian ideal beauty images and imported North American popular culture. Hollywood movie stars in cosmetics advertisements called for Asian women to wear make up to produce the illusion of wide eyes, narrow cheeks, and pointed noses.[13] The meanings of wearing make up were connected with a Western, modernized style of femininity and liberated sexuality. In contrast, Japanese companies like Shiseido occupied their market advantage in skin-whitening products, making reference to the image of Asian women with proper delicacy and elegant manners.

The discourses delivered by U.S. and Japanese companies converged to the point that skin care or wearing make up became a key element in the look of "modern women." Young single women born after World War II were the pioneer generation of Taiwanese women who left their agricultural hometowns and migrated to urban factories far away from their patriarchal families. Borrowing Mike Featherstone's metaphor, these young women no longer viewed their bodies as "a vessel of sin to hide or cover" but used them to display their recently achieved independence and freedom. This was similar to what Kathy Peiss described as occurring in the United States in the early twentieth century, "This acceptance [of cosmetics] was no mere fad or fashion, but a large change in the way women perceived their identities and displayed them on the face and body."[14] They used lotion and cream to maintain their light, smooth skin that was no longer exposed to sunshine in the field. They put on powder and lipstick to attract the attentions of male coworkers who were potential mates for marriages based on free love. Cosmetics marked the women's new membership in the urban life as well as their rebellion against the traditional norms of femininity and sexuality.

The Taiwanese government did not permit the direct import of foreign cosmetics until 1981, and it charged a high tariff from 1981 to 1895. Foreign cosmetics products were accessible to only a small group of people who had the privilege of travelling abroad or who could afford expensive indirect imports (two to three times that of local products). The consumption of foreign cosmetics products was considered a sign of fashion and status due to limited availability and expensive prices. Until 1985, the trend of economic liberalization pushed the government to lower the tariff for cosmetics from 85 percent to 55 percent. In the meanwhile, martial law in Taiwan was terminated in 1986 after enforcement for almost forty years. Most regulations from the state and school authorities over adult and teenagers' bodies were lifted.[15] In the post-martial law period of Taiwan, consumerism peacefully took over the domination of political authority. The growth of the beauty industry, in both kind and scale, indicated the celebration of individual freedom as well as the collective worship of global fashion.

Paralleling the proliferation of cosmetics and other beauty industries, the social images for the occupation of cosmetics saleswomen have changed over time. In the 1970s, many parents, husbands, and especially mothers-in-law objected to women working in department stores, because this occupation was stigmatized as an inappropriate job for "good women." Most resigned after getting married. A manager reported that cosmetics companies had a difficult time recruiting saleswomen before they successfully transformed the image of this job into a "fashion profession." The companies provided saleswomen with fancy uniforms and free cosmetics, and they offered training sessions on styles of conversation and manners. Cosmetics saleswomen often traveled around the whole country, even to a small fishing island, to promote foreign cosmetics products and demonstrate

wearing make up. Two retired saleswomen proudly recalled that cosmetics sales was considered one of the most glamorous jobs for Taiwanese women at that time, second only to flight attendants who enjoyed the privilege of traveling worldwide. Lin-Yi, who worked as a saleswoman in the department store for more than ten years, recalled the situation in the early 1970:

> After I graduated from high school, my first job was selling accessories in a department store. I was so excited when I got that job! I was just a 19-year-old girl from the countryside. I was amazed how beautiful the department store was. There was music, air conditioner. And we could even talk to friends while we were working! Not like working in the factory, [it was] boring. In those days, working in a department store, you had to stand from 10 A.M. to 10 P.M. But I didn't feel tired at all. I was so happy, thinking this job was wonderful. Every day I got to see lots of foreigners, rich people and fashion women!

Many young women such as Lin-Yi were so allured by the sparklingly decorated, music-playing, and air-conditioned department stores that they never complained about standing twelve hours every day. In contrast to dirty, noisy, and enclosed factories, department stores attracted them with excitement, public exposure, and the fantasy of middle-class identification. This is similar to what Susan Benson wrote about department store sales work in the early twentieth century United States: This job was viewed as a "Cinderella occupation" that offered young women upward mobility, glamor, and white-collar respectability.[16]

In the 1990s, the saturation and tight competition of foreign cosmetics markets resulted in a huge reduction in retail prices. The availability of imported cosmetics made the previous marketing strategies, such as status distinction or exoticism, no longer sufficient to attract Taiwanese consumers. The cosmetics company's n new marketing plan is to establish their brand distinction based on the claim of professionalism. Everett Hughes argues that the essence of the professional claim is that "they profess to know better than

others the nature of certain matters, and to know better than their clients what ails them or their affairs."[17] The professional authority of the cosmetics industry is built on a complex system of esoteric knowledge about the maintenance and decoration of women's bodies. It divides consumer bodies into endless typologies with subtle differences to allow an increasing complex proliferation of products.[18] Cosmetics companies consolidate their professional legitimacy and market advantages on the basis of alleged scientific innovations, such as antiwrinkle and hydroxy acid products. In Taiwan, these professional discourses gain extra credibility when they are transplanted from advanced Western countries like France, Switzerland, or the United States.

As cosmetics companies in contemporary Taiwan stride along the path of professionalization, the tendency of new management is to produce "skilled" salespeople who are capable of delivering professional claims and other complex messages to consumers. Workers are assigned an increasing variety of tasks on the selling floor, involving multiple performances of bodily labor.

Tripartite Requirements of Bodily Labor

Although cosmetics saleswomen are hired by cosmetics companies, their work sites are scattered in different department stores. Their labor process, as such, is under the supervision of "two bosses." Saleswomen are overseen by the "coordinator" from cosmetics companies, who is in charge of five to ten counters located in different department stores, as well as the "floor supervisor" of department stores, who patrols all the counters on the same floor. Though saleswomen are paid by cosmetics companies rather than by department stores, the latter can deduct money from the share of sales profits they

release to cosmetics companies. In Taiwan, customer payments collected by counter saleswomen are submitted to department stores first. After deducting an agreed portion covering rent and management fees, department stores give the remaining portion to individual cosmetics companies at the end of every month. Yet, because the coordinator from the cosmetics companies cannot constantly watch over all counters and the department store supervisor cannot directly control saleswomen's wages, neither is constantly present in the daily labor activities. As a saleswoman said, "you can say we have *two bosses,* but you can also say we have *no boss*!"

Another group of agents involved in the supervision of saleswomen are the customers browsing and shopping in department stores. Previous studies have revealed that customers and clients are often recruited as agents to evaluate and monitor the activities of service workers.[19] This picture is especially true at cosmetics sales counters where no supervisor is stationed on a constant basis. Both department stores and cosmetics companies encourage customers to participate in the surveillance of saleswomen as the "third boss." Customers who fill out service evaluation forms can receive bonus gifts. Their complaint letters are often used by managers as proof to evaluate or punish saleswomen.

The traditional labor process theory, grounded on the experiences of manufacturing workers, presumes that the major goal of labor control is to ensure the appropriation of surplus values produced by workers.[20] However, salespeople and other service workers produce no material products, their interactions with customers constitute the raw material of the labor process, and the deals they make are the only quantitative criteria for the measurement of productivity. Cosmetics saleswomen typically receive a small basic salary and earn most of their income from commission calculated based on their sales records.

Commission is based on either individual sales (one salesperson) or group sales (all salespeople at one counter). Some companies calculate commission on individual sales to avoid "free riding" by "lazy" workers. Other companies adopt group sales calculation because of concerns that competition among saleswomen creates a bad impression for customers. Very few cosmetics companies in Taiwan offer retirement or pension programs.

In fact, the sales records only cover part of the labor activities of cosmetics saleswomen. Their everyday tasks include two major components: backstage preparation and counter performance. Behind the counter, saleswomen take inventory of commodities, clean the surroundings, and keep sales records. The more visible activities are their interactions with customers up front—they smile, greet, explain commodities, make deals, and collect payment. What they sell at the counters are not merely cosmetics products but the signs and images attached to the process of shopping. Cosmetics saleswomen's bodies not only provide physical strength and movement to conduct labor activities but also function as the medium of conveying specific images and emotional status to customers.

From the symbolic labor performance of cosmetics saleswomen, some questions follow: What are the images and messages conveyed to customers on the selling floor? How do saleswomen embody and convey these signs in their labor practices? How does management supervise their labor performance in these regards? I identify three components of bodily labor that are required for cosmetics saleswomen to perform: *the disciplined body* (providing deferential services through standardized bodily gestures and emotional management), *the mirroring body* (embodying the beauty images as a reflection of cosmetics products), *and the communicating body* (pursuing the professional authority of body/knowledge).[21] The tripartite performance of bodily labor involves multiple and even

contradictory messages conveyed to customers. Saleswomen are expected to provide submissive services for customers at the same time they pursue domination over customers. They become a sexy idol but also a figure of scientific authority in the eyes of consumers.

To supervise these different components of bodily labor, management exercises diverse or even conflicting strategies of labor control. Richard Edwards reviews the transformation of workplace in the twentieth century and identifies two major strategies of labor control: *exploitation,* which assures the appropriation of surplus value produced by workers, and *standardization* or *routinization,* which disciplines workers to perform standardized bodily action under the scrutiny of scientific work-study. I identify two more strategies involved in the supervision of bodily labor performed by cosmetics saleswomen. In contrast to maximizing the exploitation of workers' physical strengths, mangers also need to *maintain* the beauty of their mirroring bodies. In addition to the standardization of work scripts to minimize uncertainty, managers have to release a certain degree of *flexibility* and *autonomy* to workers in their communication with a variety of customers.[22]

The Disciplined Body

One of the major messages delivered on the selling floor is to convince customers that "we provide better service than other stores." Deference is a major characteristic of quality service and such work is usually carried out by women. In department stores, the management adopts many disciplinary measures in the work scripts that enforce meticulous control over the operation of saleswomen's bodies to assure their utility as well as their docility.[23]

Three to four saleswomen are usually assigned to each counter. During the store

hours (10:30 A.M. to 9:00 P.M.), they take two or three shifts to keep a minimum of two staff on duty. A daily working shift is usually eight hours. The time allotted for taking meals and going to the bathroom is limited. Most department stores require saleswomen to stand all day, even without the presence of customers. Their lunch and dinner schedules are irregular depending on their shifts and are often delayed by customers. These working conditions may cause health problems (e.g., back, kidney, or stomach) of which I commonly heard about from my informants. Each saleswoman is eligible for four or five days off a month. During peak seasons, saleswomen are usually required to work overtime in the evening, without extra pay in some cases.

Attitudes towards customers are often standardized and instrumentally coded in their work scripts. For example, salespeople are required to repeat scripted statements whenever they greet a customer, such as “How are you doing today?” and “Thanks for coming.” A management manual published by the department store trade association in Taiwan boldly suggests directions for the angles of bowing to customers (fifteen degrees for “please wait a moment,” thirty degrees for “welcome,” and forty-five degrees for “thanks for coming”). The extreme example of body engineering is that of elevator ladies in Japanese-style department stores. These young ladies, dressed in skirt suits and wearing hats, repeat the same greeting scripts, smile, and bow to every customer entering the elevator—as elegant and mechanical as a beautiful robot. Before the stores open every morning, some department stores request their staff to stand in line, repeating greeting words loudly and practicing bowing together. Such a vocalization practice is a common exercise in Japanese management culture, which aims to “inculcate receptiveness and a willingness to greet and appreciate others and to eliminate resistance toward responding positively toward

authority."[24]

Saleswomen perform the disciplined body not only with their physical movements but also with their emotions and feelings. As a department store supervisor eloquently told me during an interview, training on manners and bodily gestures is not complete until they have become part of the workers' nature. Salespeople are instructed to love this job based on the belief that "serving other people makes me proud and happy." "Customers first" and "customers are always right" are the guiding principles they have to always keep in mind. A female manager drew an analogy between the role of saleswomen and the role of daughters-in-law in Chinese families. Customers are like their parents-in-law who should be served with courteous manners and submissive attitudes. Because customers are recruited as surveillance agents, saleswomen need to manage their emotions and suppress their anger and frustration towards rude customers even without the presence of mangers. Some saleswomen wrote down slogans on the back of the counter or on their accounting books, such as "You see a clearer sky and a wider ocean after taking one step backward," and "Those who get angry are real losers."

The above discussion reveals the strategies of standardization and routinization, which can be traced back to the development of scientific management in the early twentieth century. It is best exemplified by Taylorism, which treats workers' bodies as objects under scientific work-study and disciplines workers to perform standardized bodily actions in a deskilled and fractured manufacturing labor process.[25] Yet, in a service setting that involves high unpredictability in accommodating the needs of various clients, over-standardized work scripts may become a barrier to communication rather than a facilitator. A service worker carrying a standardized smile may be criticized by customers

for being “phony” or acting “like a robot.”[26] Managers, thus, need to release some degree of autonomy and flexibility to saleswomen for dealing with diverse customers and situations. The professionalization of the cosmetic industry in the 1990s further calls for the addition of another type of bodily labor to enhance saleswomen’s status, which will be discussed in a later section.

The Mirroring Body

When customers approach the counter, they purchase not only cosmetic products *per se* but also the cultural images attached to the products and the process of shopping. The consumer images are multilayered. The shiny mirrors, stylish counters, and the displays of delicate product packages refer to a lifestyle of fashion, wealth, and taste. The super-sized pictures of models and movie stars hanging over the counters deliver the promises of achieving beauty and preserving youth. This point is well made by a Revlon manager, who was quoted by an informant, “In factories we produce lipstick, in stores we sell hope!” And, saleswomen who stand and smile behind the counter act like living mannequins to display commodities and mirror the beauty images. A saleswoman recalled the day when the cosmetics company came to her high school to recruit employees, “We were asked to walk on stage. It is like a beauty contest.” Age, height, weight, appearance, and skin conditions, rather than relevant education or previous experience, are considered more important qualifications for matching the cultural image of this occupation, “the ambassador of beauty.”

After being recruited into this occupation, the bodies of saleswomen continue to be monitored and transformed during and after work. During the working day, they have to

wear stockings, black high heels, and fitted uniforms. Long hair has to be worn in a bun, and bangs are not allowed. Their make up and nail polish have to comply with the fashionable colors being promoted that season. Attentive supervisors periodically show up without notice to make sure that these regulations are obeyed. Ubiquitous mirrors around the counters also remind saleswomen to check on make up and hairdos a dozen times a day. In addition, the company provides free make up and skin care, which is used both during working hours and after work. These free products represent not only a benefit for employees but also a measure for *maintaining* their bodies. Just as ammonia is used to maintain the shininess of shop windows and mirrors, saleswomen are encouraged to constantly engage themselves in body maintenance so they can effectively embody the beauty images at work.

However, human bodies are not mirrors. They get old, sick, and pregnant, thereby becoming "disable" to perform the image of young, pretty bodies. During the 1960s and 1970s, most cosmetics companies in Taiwan forced pregnant saleswomen to quit their jobs. In 1995, when I conducted my fieldwork, at least one company still requested pregnant saleswomen to be off duty during the last six months at half their basic pay. Discrimination against pregnant women is different in the cases of cosmetics saleswomen and factory workers. Taiwan's newspapers used to report that some factory employers exploited pregnant workers by coercing them to continue working until the day of giving birth. In contrast, pregnant cosmetics saleswomen are forced to take a leave and deprived of their rights to work. This contrast underscores the significance of the mirroring body in the labor process of selling cosmetics, which emphasizes beauty maintenance rather than physical exploitation only.

For a young woman who just graduated from high school with little work experience or skills, selling cosmetics is one of the best-paying jobs she can get. Women's youth and beauty constitute one kind of capital that derives job opportunities and monetary value in the beauty industry. Yet, unlike economic or cultural capital, body capital cannot be accumulated over time and will decline with the increase of age. In Taiwan, the occupation of cosmetics sales is perceived as limited. A saleswoman will become unqualified for the job after reaching a certain age, when her body is no longer young and pretty. Almost all of my informants expressed facing a strong social pressure in this regard because "an old lady will feel embarrassed to stay in the job." This social perception pushes many saleswomen to voluntarily quit or shift to other positions after getting pregnant or turning thirty. When I asked my informants about their companies' retirement policies, most had no knowledge and showed no concern about it. One laughed at me and said, "Come on, almost everybody leaves the job after thirty. Who needs retirement, anyway?"

The dead-end nature of this occupation reflects the social depreciation of body capital. Most cosmetics companies offer few promotions for saleswomen except for the limited positions like patrol supervisors and training instructors. Only lower-ranking supervisors are recruited from counter workers, whereas higher-ranking area managers are recruited from office employees and are mostly staffed by men. In fact, the salaries of instructors and supervisors are usually lower than the commission-based wage of saleswomen. Most saleswomen shift to supervisor positions after getting married or having children to seek a nine-to-five work schedule that allows them to accommodate with their family life more easily. I later discuss how saleswomen cope with the limited opportunities on this career ladder and how this situation impacts their performances of bodily labor.

The Communicating Body

Shopping for cosmetics may be a trip of pleasure, but it is also an occasion for consumers to acquire information about beauty products and rituals. As mentioned earlier, cosmetics companies have established their professional authority by developing a complicated knowledge/power system regarding skin care and body maintenance. They constantly update fashion-sensitive advertisements about make up products and styles. Saleswomen serve as their on-site agents who enact the normalizing body discourses through their communication with customers in verbal as well as body language.

Cosmetics companies have improved upon a lot of aspects of the work scripts to achieve the professionalization of the selling floor. The title, saleswoman, is euphemized as "beauty counselor" or "beauty director." Some company uniforms even imitate the pharmacist's white suit. Their work has expanded to include explaining the chemical components of cosmetics, providing personal skin care direction, using technical instruments for skin tests, and even performing cybernetics (computer skin tests, video make up simulations, etc.). The training program for cosmetics saleswomen has also been broadened to include more varieties of professional courses. Saleswomen are trained to be familiar with the whole system of products that are designed and classified for women with different skin types and ages, and for their uses in different seasons, climates, regions, altitudes, times of day, modes of activity, and so on. Some saleswomen still recall the pain of taking quizes every morning during the month-long training program. Cosmetics companies periodically offer courses on make up skills, and prescribe fashion magazines as required readings for saleswomen to catch up on current trends.

Saleswomen establish their professional status over customers by claiming their expertise on skin care ("The products you are using now, whatever brand they are, are not working for you."), aesthetics ("I don't think this color [of make up] you are wearing really fits you."), and fashion ("Your style of makeup is kind of out-of-date. Would you like to try something more fashionable?"). They increase their credibility by displaying high-tech instruments for skin examination or showing off chemical jargon about product components.

Saleswomen also develop their own skills for dominating customers of different ages and genders and share them with each other. They warn adult women of the urgency of fighting the decay of the body ("Didn't you notice that? More and more wrinkles have appeared on your forehead."). They pressure teenage girls to start beautification as a feminine rite of passage ("It's never too early to start taking care of your skin. You don't want to wait until it's too late."). And, they draw on their personal experiences to convince embarrassed male customers to approach the counter and buy cosmetics for their wives or girlfriends ("We understand what women want. Your wife will definitely love this!").

In general, saleswomen agree with rather than resist these work routines in their pursuit of the professionalization of cosmetics sales. Adopting the management rhetoric of professionalism, they positively interpret the disciplinary measures over their bodies, such as their uniform, make up, and even standardized behaviors, as things "just to help us look more professional." The reason saleswomen love to practice these work routines is because their professional status provides what Hochschild called a "status shield" that protects saleswomen from customers' attacks upon their self-esteem. Leidner also points out that, in the triangular relationship among service workers, employers, and customers, the interests

of workers and employers are not necessarily opposed to each other. Insurance agents in her study embraced managerially imposed routinization because these routines increased the agents' control over service interactions.[27]

In the triangular relationship among saleswomen, managers, and customers, I observed different kinds of alliances occurring depending on what kind of bodily labor and what kind of message was involved. As *the disciplined body* and *the mirroring body*, saleswomen are required to provide humble service and to convey beauty images. The interests of employers and customers tend to be congruent, and customers are incorporated into the managerial "team" to assist body discipline over workers. Yet, as *the communicating body*, the interests of the employer and saleswomen are consistent. Employers depend on saleswomen to convey the professional authority on the selling floor, and saleswomen are willing to accept the work rules that empower themselves vis-à-vis customers.

Performance of Bodily Labor

So far I have documented the tripartite requirements of bodily labor; this section further explores agency and diversity in the performance of bodily labor. Individual saleswomen accomplish bodily labor in different ways—some comply with it and some resist it, and they may embrace part of it while challenging another part of it. Hochschild suggests that emotional labor can be accomplished through either "surface acting"—to disguise what you feel and pretend to feel what you do not, or "deep acting"—to take over the levers of feeling production and actually alter what you feel.[28] Drawing on this distinction, I raise a similar question to analyze the performance of bodily labor: Do cosmetics saleswomen

internalize the body discipline enforced by employers as deep acting, or do they perform bodily labor only on the surface and leave their bodies intact?

My research found both ways for saleswomen to accomplish bodily labor. On the one hand, saleswomen engage themselves in a deep acting of bodily labor: They may internalize the body discipline to achieve the ideal feminized body, or they embrace the professional role to downplay more sexualized components of bodily labor. On the other hand, saleswomen limit their performance of bodily labor on the surface by resisting or loosening labor control on a daily basis. The temporary nature and high turnover rate of this occupation encourage saleswomen to stage a skin-deep performance of emotional labor, but reinforce their engagement in restless maintenance against the aging of their body capital.

Deep Acting of Bodily Labor

The performance of the mirroring body, inseparable from the personal consumer experiences of saleswomen, usually involves deep acting. Some saleswomen admitted to me that a major sense of their job satisfaction came from the public admiration and confirmation of their beauty: “The reason why I chose this job is very simple—for vanity! Every woman is obsessed with beauty.” “If you are able to work at a cosmetics counter, you’ve got to be pretty, right?” Some male customers come to the counter to strike up conversations. There is even a Cinderella story circulating among the counters—some saleswomen married handsome rich men whom they met at work. An invisible but effective mechanism of oversight actually comes from customers, passing by every day in department stores. The gazes from male customers evaluate saleswomen’s bodies, and the gazes from female customers represent as imitation or envy of the beauty of saleswomen.

As Sandra Barkty argues, the disciplinary practices of femininity usually lack a formal institutional structure, creating the impression that the production of femininity is voluntary or natural.[29] The disciplinary mechanisms for feminized bodies extend beyond the boundaries of the workplace. They are not centralized or oppressive but are dispersed, anonymous, and seductive.

Working in a neon cage, a saleswoman is also a consumer surrounded and seduced by abundant commodities and images. The performance of her bodily labor is inseparable from her consumer activities, which require extensive knowledge and constant efforts as well. Susan Benson insightfully described this labor-consumption nexus: "What a saleswoman learned behind the counter helped her consume more intelligently, while what she learned from the other side of the counter enabled her to sell with extra assurance."[30] Many saleswomen, especially single and young ones, spend large amounts of money shopping in their workplace. Two informants explained:

> Working in the department store, you need a strong willpower [*laug*h]. I am not kidding you. It can become really horrifying. I have to forbid myself to bring my wallet when I go to the bathroom. Otherwise…[*smiles*], especially because now you can put everything on the credit card.

> We all spend a hell a lot of money. Because when you work in a department store, you always know what's on sale. And people working in other counters will give you discounts and all that. Then you just can't help it.

These remarks, along with my observations, identify three institutional factors that facilitate and accelerate the consumer behaviors of saleswomen. First, because the workplace overlaps a consumer space, the activities of labor and consumption are conveniently connected in time and space. I often noticed that many saleswomen returned from their lunch breaks, and even from the bathroom, with shopping bags. Second, on a particular day of every month (usually right after payday), department store staff enjoy a

twenty to forty percent discount on commodities. They also get informal discounts from saleswomen at neighboring counters, called “favor price” or “mutual-help price.” The third mechanism stimulating consumption is credit cards, which have only become popular in Taiwan since the mid-1990s. One credit card agent I ran into in a department store told me that saleswomen are one of the major targets in their promotion plan. With the convenience provided by credit cards, saleswomen are able to delay payments, enlarge purchases, and defer rational calculation on debts. As a result, most of their monthly wages go to their shopping bills.

Saleswomen also perform bodily labor in the way of deep acting to negotiate their identities among contested discourses at work. As I have demonstrated, the performance of bodily labor involves contradictory messages and diverse components. Saleswomen may identify and internalize some aspects of bodily labor in attempt to minimize other aspects of it. Some saleswomen embrace and internalize the professional identity not only to safeguard themselves from customer attacks but also to resist the deprecating image of a sexy lady that is imposed on their bodies and occupation. For example, Pin-Yu graduated from a prestigious high school but gave up her plan of going to college due to financial difficulties. During our conversations, she often emphasized the professional aspect of her job:

> Most of my high school classmates are college students now. Some of them were surprised to see me working in a department store. They would say, “how come you are doing this” and so on. I know what they are thinking. I am not as vain as some other saleswomen you met. I believe this occupation is changing. It’s becoming more and more professional, really.

Another event in the summer of 1996 demonstrated how saleswomen maneuvered the contradictory messages in their performance of bodily labor to empower themselves. A

French-Taiwanese co-capitalized department store that had allowed saleswomen to sit in chairs to convey an elegant European style decided to copy a management rule from its Japanese-styled competitors. The new rule, which required saleswomen to stand during all of their working time even without the presence of customers, induced strong reaction among its saleswomen. They organized on-site opposition by sitting in chairs while serving customers as a way of defending their "elegant service style." This collective action, however, failed in the end. The department store refused to rescind the new rule, and those who were visible figures in the protest had to quit their jobs under the pressure of their cosmetics or clothing companies.

This scenario reveals that the multiple components of bodily labor are actually lopsided. The "professional" status and "elegant" images of saleswomen (as they perform in the communicating body and the mirroring body) are prone to break down, exposing their vulnerable status in performing submissive services (the disciplined body). Saleswomen hold no professional power based on exclusive training, licensed privilege, or collective organization. They possess only limited autonomy and temporary authority granted by the "two bosses," the cosmetics company and the department store, instead of "no boss." For example, one saleswoman told this story: A saleswoman once had an argument with a department store supervisor. She said to him that, "This is none of your business! I am not paid by your company. Don't bother about me!" She then got fired after the cosmetics company was informed of this event. Besides, saleswomen also need to defer to the demands and judgements of customers, the third boss. When customers challenge the professional authority of saleswomen or treat them rudely, the two bosses usually stand on the side of customers, who are "always right."

Surface Acting of Bodily Labor

Labor control in the neon cage is not seamless; it is filled with fractures that allow resistance and subversion on a local scale. Saleswomen may perform bodily labor on the surface level by resisting disciplinary rules on a daily basis. In my observations, when no supervisors or customers were present, saleswomen sat in chairs or chatted with the saleswomen at neighboring counters. When the supervisor, who patrolled around many counters with no fixed schedule, showed up in the end of the hall, the first saleswoman to notice would instantly inform others. The warning passed around the floor so rapidly that most workers could return to their positions upon the supervisor's arrival. Right after the supervisor's visit, some saleswomen called to their friends working in the neighboring department stores: "Get ready! The supervisor just left our counter and will get to yours soon!"

A similar surface acting occurs in the dimension of the mirroring body. Although many saleswomen enjoy the role of "beauty ambassador," some others complained to me about the trouble of wearing heavy make up: "I have to spend at least half an hour in putting on make up before coming to work. I am often late because of this trouble." "I don't like to wear make up as heavy as the company asks us to. It is weird to wear heavy make up standing on the bus. People looked at me, because that is so unnatural." What attracts more resistance among saleswomen is the regulation by cosmetics companies on their styles of makeup: "Sometimes the company asks us to wear a particular color of make up for promotion. I hate that! The color may be fashionable, but, it does not fit me." Some try to wear less make up or wear it in their own styles. To some extent, these actions lessen the

domination of a normalizing beauty image and defend saleswomen's autonomy against the body discipline enforced by the management.[31]

A surface performance of bodily labor also results from the temporary nature of the occupation. Based on my survey of twenty-eight saleswomen at seventeen cosmetics counters in one department store, twenty expressed a desire to change jobs in the near future, and twelve had held their current job for less than two years. Only six saleswomen had stayed in their present job over five years. In an organization with a glass ceiling and age discrimination, cosmetics saleswomen tend to choose quitting and job-hopping as their strategies for maximizing interests. Once, I asked a saleswoman how she and her colleagues dealt with the unfair and often arbitrary sales goal for calculating commissions. She lowered her voice and said, "Our manager is too stingy. Many of us are 'hopping' to other companies after the New Year."

Saleswomen adopt the attitudes of conformity and tolerance instead of open confrontation, not only because they lack skills to bargain with employers but also because they assume they will stay in the occupation for only a short period. Jun-Jun, who plans to open her own lingerie store in the future, told me, "You only do this job when you're young, so nobody will go to protest even though the sales goal is unreasonable. Grab the chance to make money while you can! Then save an easy life for your older age."

The temporality of their job identity has an impact on how cosmetics saleswomen perform emotional labor. Shu-Fen, single and twenty-two years old, has never stayed in the same job for more than two years since graduating from high school. She abides by the rules of emotional management only superficially because, she says, "I only earn a little money from them. They don't have the right to treat me like a maid! Finding a new job is

no big deal for me anyway." The foreseeable result of having to leave because of aging also discourages saleswomen from developing a long-term identification with this profession. For example, Hui-Mei, married for just three months, was thinking about quitting soon. She told me, "Whenever I meet some disgusting customers, I tell myself in my heart that I will leave this job soon. Then I won't need to bow to them anymore."

Yet, in the mean time, the short-lived nature of this occupation encourages saleswomen to intensively participate in the maintenance of the mirroring body. Because preserving beauty and youth seems the only way to prolong their careers, most regularly and intensively engage in the practices of beautification. Once I asked a saleswoman how long she planned to stay in the occupation. She answered with a bitter smile: "Well, as long as I can. So I have to take good care of my skin. Use more products! Do more facials!" Her words disclose a circuit between a saleswoman's bodily labor and her body consumption. To resist the depreciation of body capital, saleswomen consume a variety of beautification products to maintain their glamorous appearance, and they continue to work harder and longer to pay for the expenses accrued while cultivating their bodies.

Gender Division of Bodily Labor

Cosmetics sales is often defined as a "woman's job." A U.S. cosmetics company in Taiwan recruited a group of men in the early 1990s as a ploy to boost its declining business. The rational was explained succinctly by the company's slogan at that time, "to see women's beauty from men's eyes." Although these men were selling cosmetics like their female coworkers, they were constructed as "professionals" who enjoy privileged treatment in benefits, training, and job assignments. I use this case to demonstrate how bodily labor is

divided along gender lines, and how gender discourses become subtexts for making professional claims in the beauty industry.[32]

When hired, men with a college degree were preferred (women needed only a high school diploma), and no specific requirements were imposed on their age or marital status (women had to be young and, preferably, single). These men were called "male makeup artists" or "MMAs" (their title was literarily in English), which differed the saleswomen's title, "*Mei-Ron-Shih*" (meaning "beauty advisor" in Chinese) or "BAs." Instead of promoting female instructors who had training and make-up skills, the cosmetics company chose to construct a privileged group of male professionals based on the gender stereotypes prevalent among customers.[33] This project of professionalization was achieved through the creation of a vertical segregation within the occupation in parallel with dichotomous gender stereotypes and inequality in the society.

In this case, professionalization was also a gender-segregated process of transferring knowledge and skills, in which men held privileges and women were excluded. MMAs had access to better cosmetic tools and higher levels of training. MMAs also enjoyed a superior status in the division of labor; they were assigned to duties associated with skill and authority, such as skin-care advising and make-up demonstrations, and excused from lower-status tasks like cleaning and emptying trash. The recruitment of men brought about the revaluation of the originally feminized, degraded job. The upgrading was clearly indicated by the wage differential between genders. An MMA received a basic salary almost twice more than a BA or a female instructor did, although an instructor performed similar tasks as a MMA and had even more experience and seniority.

The component of bodily labor assigned to MMAs was different from their female

colleagues. The bodies of MMAs were rarely used as *the disciplined body* (providing deferential services) or *the mirroring body* (displaying beauty images); instead, they were used as *the communicative body* (pursuing professional domination). The male body was consistently constructed as a seeing and talking body, playing the role of professional authority. Manipulating masculinity as a subtext for making professional claims is a relatively smooth process, compared to the contradictory components of bodily labor for saleswomen. Although saleswomen play a similar role as a professional communicator, their bodies are simultaneously constructed as sexual objects to be judged and evaluated as well as passive carriers of deferential services, both in accordance to the cultural ideals of femininity and women's domestic roles.

When MMAs took this "women's job," many of their parents and friends (especially girlfriends) objected. To overcome the crisis of demasculinization, they sought the professional claim as a status shield to safeguard their manhood and self-respect.[34] During my interview with Jeh-Min, a former MMA who was later transferred to the office, he repeatedly emphasized that "we men look much more professional than those BAs." To him, hierarchically dividing MMAs and BAs by wage and job assignment was legitimate considering their "sacrifice" in taking a degraded feminized job. In his words, "We have sacrificed a lot! How could a man bear doing a job like cosmetics sales? We are professionals! How could we collect money or empty trash?!"

After MMAs were recruited for a year, no obvious progress was made in the company's declining business so the company cancelled the project. The MMAs were then shifted to regular duties (i.e., standing at counters together with BAs). The company paid a higher price for salesmen who did not bring in extra profits with their constructed

professional charms. It, therefore, tried to push out these MMAs in informal ways, for example, by putting them under the supervision of senior BAs and assigning them the same jobs as a BA's. Most of these MMAs left after a short period, once the professional image of cosmetics sales was peeled off to expose the devalued and feminine nature of this occupation. Jeh-Min recounted how he felt about the working conditions at that time, "When I stood behind the counter, people usually thought I was the manager or the saleswoman's boyfriend—it was really embarrassing! That was why most of us could not stand it anymore."

In recent years, male consumers, both gay and straight, have become a target market for cosmetics and other fashion products. The burgeoning male fitness and beauty culture is reconstructing the mainstream image of the male body and conception of manhood. Recent scholars have paid attention to the advertisements for male cosmetics and fashion products that celebrate male "femininity" and the erotic display of the male body, in combination with masculine statements such as assertion and activeness.[35] The job of selling male cosmetics further transforms the body perception and experiences of salesmen. For example, a nineteen-year-old man who worked at a cosmetic counter while attending college in the evening, told me with confidence, "Of course I've never used skincare or makeup before. [I thought] that was too sissy. But, I have started using them so I can persuade other men to. And I am actually feeling really good! Times are changing. Who said men cannot wear and sell makeup?" Male service workers in the beauty industry contribute their bodily labor to the cultivation of new male bodies while also struggling to detach themselves from the images of effeminacy and homosexuality. This topic is beyond the scope of this article, but it does require attention for further analysis.

Conclusion

This case study of cosmetics saleswomen in Taiwan examines the making of gendered bodies in the labor process of selling cosmetics and promoting beauty culture. Taiwanese saleswomen, employed at the low end of the multinational cosmetics industry, display and reproduce a Western, heterosexual, cosmeticized mode of femininity. They perform bodily labor not only during their interactions with customers but also in their personal consumption and daily body maintenance. My analysis contributes to the studies of service labor and feminist literature in three major ways:

First, I raise the concept of *bodily labor* to describe the expanding service occupations associated with the proliferating beauty industry in contemporary consumer societies. When manipulating images and delivering messages become the major work requirement and bodily interactions with customers becomes the raw material of the labor process, more dimensions of workers' bodies are involved in labor performance and subject to discipline and surveillance. I have identified three components of bodily labor: the disciplined body, the mirroring body, and the communicating body. Labor control over the saleswomen not only targets the exploitation of surplus values created by their physical labor but also aims to ensure that they adequately embody the beauty images and successfully appeal to consumers' desire.

Second, I demonstrate how the discursive meanings of *gender* are materially enacted and constantly negotiated in the performance of bodily labor. My study shows that the female body, neither a biological essence nor a discursive text alone, is materially located and discursively reconstructed in women's daily work. The content of bodily labor assigned

to cosmetics saleswomen is inscribed with the cultural ideal of femininity and women's domestic roles. In contrast, the masculine bodies of salesmen are hired to signify the professional claims of the cosmetics industry. Women with youth and beauty possess a body capital that derives monetary value in this labor market. However, to combat the depreciation of their body capital, saleswomen have to engage themselves in restless body maintenance beyond the territory of workplaces.

Third, my analysis underscores *contestation* and *agency* in the power dynamics of labor control and gender politics. Cosmetics saleswomen are required to convey multiple messages to customers, a mix of deferential service, beauty performance, and professional communication. Workers are not passive victims but active agents who maneuver these contradictory meanings to negotiate their identities and empower themselves. They endorse the professionalization of cosmetics sales to challenge the traditional constructs of femininity such as a passive server or a sexy idol. Despite the scarcity of collective actions and organization, saleswomen develop local tactics of resistance to enhance their life chances given the structural and cultural constraints. The performance of bodily labor also reveals contestation and fluidity in dichotomous gender discourses. The case of recruiting men into this feminized occupation reveals the concurrent reconstruction of masculinity and male bodies in consumer capitalism.

My analysis of bodily labor can be applied to other service workers who sell commodities or provide services associated with the cultural ideals of body, such as beauticians, hair stylists, body trainers, cosmetic surgeons, and employees in clothing boutiques, dieting centers, body-shaping studios, and so on. Given their variations in gender, skill level, and employment conditions, these workers may perform the three components

of bodily labor in different patterns and with different emphases. We need further studies to demonstrate the diversity and complexity of bodily labor in consumer capitalism. The oppressive image of an iron cage no longer adequately describes the contemporary service workplace, in which labor control and gender domination constitute something more like a seductive neon cage that features the intertwining of labor and consumption, sweat and glamor, and restraint and desire.

NOTES

I thank all the saleswomen who satisfied my curiosity about selling cosmetics and tolerated my ignorance about wearing make up. I am grateful to Carol Heimer, Arthur Stinchcombe, Ken Dauber, Gary Alan Fine, Orville Lee, Barrie Thorne, G.S. Shieh, D.S. Chen, Peter Levin, Mariame Kaba, and Michelle Van Natta for their comments and assistances. Special thanks to the reviewers of *Feminist Studies* for their valuable suggestions. Direct all correspondences to Pei-Chia Lan, Department of Sociology, National Taiwan University, 1, Roosevelt Rd. Sec. 4, Taipei, Taiwan, 106. E-mail: pclan@ntu.edu.tw

[1] Brian Turner, "Recent Developments in the Theory of the Body;" Mike Featherstone, "The Body in Consumer Culture," in *The Body: Social Process and Cultural Theory*, ed. Mike Featherstone, Mike Hepworth, and Brian Turner (London: Sage, 1990), 1-35, 170-96.

[2] Sandra Bartky, "Foucault, Femininity and the Modernization of Patriarchal Power," in *Feminism and Foucault: Reflection and Resistance*, ed. Irene Diamond and Lee Quinby (Boston, Mass.:

Northeastern University Press, 1988), 61-86; Susan Bordo, *Unbearable Weight: Feminism, Western Culture, and the Body* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993).

[3] Lauren Langman, "Neon Cage: Shopping for Subjectivity," in *Lifestyle Shopping: The Subject of Consumption*, ed. Rob Shields (New York: Routledge, 1992), 40-82.

[4] Linda Nicholson, "Interpreting Gender," *Signs* 20 (Spring 1994): 79-105.

[5] Judith Butler asks herself in the introduction of *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of "Sex"* (New York: Routledge, 1993, 28), "If everything is discourse, what happens to the body? If everything is a text, what about violence and bodily injury?"

[6] Nancy Fraser, "Pragmatism, Feminism, and the Linguistic Turn," in her *Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 160.

[7] The making of sexual objects in the production process is discussed by Leslie Salzinger in her study of a Mexican export-processing factory, "Manufacturing Sexual Objects: 'Harassment,' Desire and Discipline on a Maquiladora Shopfloor," *Ethnography* 1 (Spring 2000): 67-92.

[8] Joan Acker, "Hierarchies, Jobs, Bodies: A Theory of Gendered Organizations," *Gender and Society* 4 (Summer 1990): 139-58; Barbara Reskin and Irene Padavic, *Men and Women at Work* (Thousand Oaks: Pine Forge, 1994); David Knight and Hugh Willmott, *Gender and the Labour Process* (London: Gower, 1986); and Jennifer Pierce, *Gender Trials: Emotional Lives in Contemporary Law Firms* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).

[9] Candace West and Don Zimmerman, "Doing Gender," in *The Social Construction of Gender*, ed. Judith Lorber and S. A. Farrell (London: Sage, 1991); Arlie Hochschild, *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983); Robin Leidner, *Fast Food, Fast Talk: Service Work and the Routinization of Everyday Life* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993).

[10] Debra Gilman, *Body Work: Beauty and Self-Image in American Culture* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).

[11] Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison* (New York: Vintage, 1977).

[12] Taiwan's "economic miracle" was grounded ion the cheap labor force of women. In the early 1970s, only 18.6% of female workers were employed in the manufacturing. By 1987, the percentage jumped to 41.5%, see Ping-Chun Hsiung, *Living Rooms as Factories: Class, Gender, and the Satellite Factory System in Taiwan* (Philadelphia, Pa.: Temple University Press 1996).

[13] The domination of Caucasian body images has a similar effect on Asian American women. Eugenia Kaw reported that a higher proportion of Asian American women pursue cosmetic surgery than any other ethnic group in the United States. Most chose nose implants or have a double-eyelid surgery, her article, "'Opening' Faces: The Politics of Cosmetic Surgery and Asian American Women," in *Many Mirrors: Body Image and Social Relations*, ed. Nicole Sault (New Brunswick, Nj.: Rutgers University Press, 1994), 241-65.

[14] Featherstone, 170; Kathy Peiss, *Hope in a Jar: The Making of America's Beauty Culture* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1998), 6.

[15] For example, not until 1987 were high school students in Taiwan asked by the school authority to wear uniforms and particular hairstyles (no perms, no bangs, and ear-length cuts for girls, and military-like cropped hair for boys). Even now, wearing makeup is still not allowed at high schools. During the 1960s and 1970s, the police often arrested long-haired men for "disrupting social morality."

[16] Susan Porter Benson, *Counter Culture: Saleswomen, Managers, and Customers in American Department Stores 1890-1940* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1986), 210.

[17] Everett C. Hughes, "Professions" in his *The Sociological Eyes: Selected Papers* (Chicago: Aldine and Atherton. 1971), 375.

[18] Gail Faurschou, "Obsolescence and Desire: Fashion and the Commodity Form," in *Postmodernism-Philosophy and the Art*, ed. H.J. Silverman (New York: Routledge, 1990), 234-59.

[19] See Leidner, 41-3; John Walsh, *Supermarkets Transformed: Understanding Organizational and*

Technological Innovations (New Brunswich, Nj.: Rutgers University Press, 1993); Linda Fuller and Vicki Smith, "Consumers' Reports: Management by Customers in a Changing Economy," in *Working in the Service Society*, ed. C. L. MacDonald and Carmen Sirianni (Philadelphia, Pa.: Temple University Press, 1996), 74-89.

[20] Michael Burawoy, *The Politics of Production: Factory Regime Under Capitalism and Socialism* (New York: Verso, 1985).

[21] My typology of bodily labor is partly inspired by Arthur Frank. In his article, "For a Sociology of Body: An Analytic Review," in *The Body: Social Process and Cultural Theory*, 36-102. Frank proposes four types of body use with different media of body action: the disciplined body (regimentation), the mirroring body (consumption), the dominating body (force), and the communicating body (recognition). The difference between my argument and Frank's is that he aims to create a general theoretical scheme applied to all bodily action, and I situate my analysis in a particular social field (the labor process) and power nexus (labor control).

[22] Richard Edwards, *Contested Terrains: The Transformation of the Workplace in the Twentieth Century* (New York: Basic Books, 1979); elsewhere, I provide more details on the multiple forms of labor control over the body. See my "Body Control of Service Workers: Cosmetics Retailers in Department Stores and Direct Selling," in *The Critical Studies of Work: Labor, Technology, and Global Production*, ed. Rick Baldoz, Charles Koeber, and Philip Kraft (Philadelphia. Pa: Temple University Press, 2001), 83-105.

[23] Elaine Hall, "Smiling, Deferring, and Flirting: Doing Gender by Giving 'Good Service,'" *Work and Occupation* 20 (Winter 1993): 452-71; Foucault, 137.

[24] Dorinne Kondo, *Crafting Selves: Power, Gender, and Discourses of Identity in a Japanese Workplace* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), 87.

[25] Edwards, 94-107.

[26] Leidner, 122; Hochschild, 136.

[27] Hochschild, 163; Leidner, 127-8, 151.

[28] Hochschild, 33.

[29] Barkty, 75.

[30] Benson, 233.

[31] In some cases, wearing make up may become an act of agency for women. For example, Page D. Delano found that American women during World War II used makeup to disrupt wartime's masculine code of power, "Making Up for War: Sexuality and Citizenship in Wartime Culture," *Feminist Studies* 26 (Spring 2000): 33-68. Also, see Kristen Dellinger and Christine Williams, who discuss how employed women transform the meanings of wearing make up to subvert the institutionalized norms in "Makeup at Work: Negotiating Appearance Rules in the Workplace," *Gender and Society* 11 (April 1997): 151-177.

[32] My analysis here is limited to a supplementary analysis of the gendered construction of bodily labor. For a more detailed discussion on men in predominantly female occupations, see Christine Williams, *Still a Men's World: Men Who Do Women's Work* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995); on professionalization as a gendered social process, see Anna Witz, *Professions and Patriarchy* (New York: Routledge, 1992).

[33] Instead of attributing gender discrimination to intentional bias or prejudice in employers, Cas Sustein argues that discrimination sometimes persists because it is economically rational to rely on a race- or sex-based generalization for saving information costs in surveying consumer needs; Cas Sustein, "Why Market Don't Stop Discrimination." *Social Philosophy and Policy* 8 (Summer 1991): 22-37.

[34] Kathy Peiss also found that North American male cosmeticians in the 1930s, such Max Factor, erased the taint of effeminacy and homosexuality by creating public images as articulate, lab-coated experts, 115-16.

[35] Susan Bordo, *The Male Body: A New Look at Men in Public and in Private* (New York: Farrar,

Straus, and Giroux, 2000), 179; the incorporation of masculinity into the advertisements of male toiletries and shaving products was initiated in the United States in the 1920s and 1930 (Peiss, 160-66); a contemporary example is Pat Kirkham and Alex Welter, “Cosmetics: A Clinique Case Study,” in *The Gendered Object*, ed. Pat Kirkham (Manchester, U.K.: Manchester University Press, 1996), 196-203.